

# Health and Human Rights Journal DECEMBER 2016, VOLUME 18, NUMBER 2

# Special Section:

# Universal Health Coverage and Human Rights

Publisher: Harvard University Press

*Editor-in-Chief* Paul Farmer

*Guest Editor* Audrey R. Chapman

*Executive Editor* Carmel Williams

*Senior Editor* Jessica Moore Kaplan

Copy Editor Morgan Stoffregen

Contributing Editor Arlan Fuller

*Designer* Catlin Rockman

#### ABOUT THE JOURNAL

Health and Human Rights Journal began publication in 1994 under the editorship of Jonathan Mann, who was succeeded in 1997 by Sofia Gruskin. Paul Farmer, co-founder of Partners In Health, assumed the editorship in 2007. Health and Human Rights Journal is an open access online publication and a leading forum of debate on global health and rights concerns. The journal maintains a tradition of critical scholarship and also provides an inclusive forum for action-oriented dialogue among human rights practitioners, with peer-reviewed articles focusing rigorous scholarly analysis on the conceptual foundations and challenges of rights discourse and action in relation to health.

*Health and Human Rights Journal* is listed in PubMed, the database of the National Library of Medicine.

### PUBLICATION POLICY

*Health and Human Rights Journal* welcomes unsolicited manuscripts on an ongoing basis. Submissions should not exceed 7000 words, while submissions to the Perspectives section should not exceed 2000 words. Book reviews and Letters to the Editor are also welcome. More information on submissions is available at http://www.hhrjournal.org/ submissions.

Please submit manuscripts through the website or by email to HHRSubmissions@hsph.harvard.edu. Author guidelines are available on the *Health and Human Rights* website (http://www.hhrjournal.org). Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the publisher, editors, editorial board members, or other members.

#### COPYRIGHT POLICY

Health and Human Rights Journal applies the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial 3.0 Unported License to all articles, with the philosophy that there should be no financial barriers to access information. The Attribution-Noncommercial license (http:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/3.0/) lets people freely copy, distribute, remix, and build upon contributors' work, provided it is not used to make a profit and the original authors and *Health and Human Rights Journal* are appropriately acknowledged. These conditions can be waived if author, as copyright holder, grants potential users explicit permission. Copyrighted material may be included in articles provided authors provide proof of written permission for such use from the copyright holder.

### OPEN ACCESS POLICY

Health and Human Rights Journal does not charge authors article processing fees unless authors can utilize an institutional open access publishing grant. Many institutions and research facilities have funding grants available to support publication in open access journals. If authors cannot access OA grants, article processing fees are waived by HHR. Authors are asked whether they can pay this fee only after a paper is accepted for publication, and inability to pay will not impact publication. When authors are able to use open access funds the article processing fee is US\$2,000.

#### **BACK ISSUES**

As an open access publication, the *Health and Human Rights Journal* is not available by subscription. All content is available free of charge at www. hhrjournal.org, including back issues since Volume 1, Number 1 (1994). Back issues are also available through JSTOR, the not-for-profit online digital archive. Users at institutions that participate in JSTOR's Arts & Sciences Complement Collection can access back issues directly by visiting the *Health and Human Rights Journal* information page at JSTOR. For more information on JSTOR, please visit http://www.jstor.org.

Health and Human Rights Journal (online) ISSN 2150-4113

#### MASTHEAD

Publisher Harvard University Press

*Editor-in-Chief* Paul E. Farmer

*Executive Editor* Carmel Williams

*Senior Editor* Jessica Moore Kaplan

*Contributing Editor* Arlan Fuller

Executive Editorial Board Cathy Albisa\* Jacqueline Bhabha Oscar Cabrera\* Audrey Chapman\* Martha Davis Sheila Davis\* Linda Fried Varun Gauri Howard Hu\* Jennifer Leaning Emmanuel Kabengele Mpinga\* Chidi Odinkalu Jacqueline Pitanguy Eric Stover\* Alicia Ely Yamin

Editorial Board Philip Alston Agnès Binagwaho Manuel Carballo Brian E. Concannon Jr. Lawrence Cox Ernest Drucker Harvey Fineberg Julio Frenk H. Jack Geiger Lawrence Gostin\* Sofia Gruskin Timothy Harding Aart Hendriks Paul Hunt Michael D. Kirby Adetokunbo O. Lucas Rakiya Omaar Richard Parker Thomas Pogge Julieta Rossi Barbara Rylko-Bauer Margaret L. Satterthwaite Haun Saussy Michael Selgelid Amartya Sen Gracelyn Smallwood Margaret A. Somerville Henry J. Steiner Bryan Stevenson Daniel Tarantola Monika Kalra Varma Gavin Yamey

\*An asterisk denotes members of the Harvard FXB *Health and Human Rights* Publishing Consortium (see below)

Founding Editor Jonathan Mann, 1994–1998

#### HHR CONSORTIUM MEMBERS

HHR's open access policy is made possible through the generous support of Harvard University Press, The FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, and our institutional consortium members. These include:

- Partners in Health, Boston
- UConn Health
- Dalla Lana School of Public Health, University of Toronto
- Mailman School, Columbia University, New York
- Institute of Global Health, Faculty of Medicine, Geneva University
- National Economic & Social Rights Initiative, New York
- O'Neill Institute for National and Global Health Law, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C.
- UNAIDS

### EDITORIAL OFFICE

Health and Human Rights Journal François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights Harvard School of Public Health 651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor Boston, MA 02115, USA Tel: (1) 617.432.0656 Fax: (1) 617.432.0656 Fax: (1) 617.432.4310 Website: http://www.hhrjournal.org Email: hhrjournal@hsph.harvard.edu

# Table of Contents

# SPECIAL SECTION ON UNIVERSAL HEALTH COVERAGE AND HUMAN RIGHTS

 $in\ collaboration\ with\ UConn\ Health$ 

- 1 EDITORIAL The Contributions of Human Rights to Universal Health Coverage Audrey R. Chapman, Guest Editor
- 7 FOREWORD Universal Health Coverage: A Return to Alma-Ata and Ottawa Dainius Puras
- 11 Three Case Studies in Making Fair Choices on the Path to Universal Health Coverage Alex Voorhoeve, Tessa T.T. Edejer, Lydia Kapiriri, Ole F. Norheim, James Snowden, Olivier Basenya, Dorjsuren Bayarsaikhan, Ikram Chentaf, Nir Eyal, Amanda Folsom, Rozita Halina Tun Hussein, Cristian Morales, Florian Ostmann, Trygve Ottersen, Phusit Prakongsai, Carla Saenz, Karima Saleh, Angkana Sommanustweechai, Daniel Wikler, and Afisah Zakariah
- 23 What Do Core Obligations under the Right to Health Bring to Universal Health Coverage? *Lisa Forman, Claudia Beiersmann, Claire E. Brolan, Martin McKee, Rachel Hammonds, and Gorik Ooms*
- 35 Using the Right to Health to Promote Universal Health Coverage: A Better Tool for Protecting Non-Nationals' Access to Affordable Health Care? Claire Lougarre
- 49 Closing the Gap Between Formal and Material Health Care Coverage in Colombia Everaldo Lamprea and Johnattan García
- 67 Human Rights and the Political Economy of Universal Health Care: Designing Equitable Financing *Anja Rudiger*
- 79 Assessing Private Sector Involvement in Health Care and Universal Health Coverage in Light of the Right to Health *Antenor Hallo de Wolf and Brigit Toebes*
- 93 Case Study of an Aboriginal Community-Controlled Health Service in Australia: Universal, Rights-Based, Publicly Funded Comprehensive Primary Health Care in Action Toby Freeman, Fran Baum, Angela Lawless, Ronald

Labonté, David Sanders, John Boffa, Tahnia Edwards, and Sara Javanparast

# GENERAL PAPERS

- 109 Interpreting the International Right to Health in a Human Rights-Based Approach to Health *Paul Hunt*
- 131 International Human Rights and the Mistreatment of Women During Childbirth Rajat Khosla, Christina Zampas, Joshua P. Vogel, Meghan A. Bohren, Mindy Roseman, and Joanna N. Erdman

- 145 Europe's Shifting Response to HIV/AIDS: From Human Rights to Risk Management Julia Smith
- 157 HIV and the Right to Health in Colombia Corey Prachniak-Rincón and Jimena Villar de Onís
- 171 HIV, Hepatitis C, TB, Harm Reduction, and Persons Deprived of Liberty: What Standards Does International Human Rights Law Establish? *Gen Sander and Rick Lines*
- 183 Reproductive Health Policy in Tunisia: Women's Right to Reproductive Health and Gender Empowerment Nada Amroussia, Isabel Goicolea and Alison Hernandez
- 195 Health for All? Sexual Orientation, Gender Identity, and the Implementation of the Right to Access to Health Care in South Africa Alexandra Müller
- 209 Australia's Efforts to Improve Food Security for Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Peoples Deanna Davy
- 219 The Mental Health of Children and Parents Detained on Christmas Island: Secondary Analysis of an Australian Human Rights Commission Data Set *Sarah Mares*
- 233 Transforming Policy into Justice: The Role of Health Advocates in Mozambique *Ellie Feinglass, Nadja Gomes, and Vivek Maru*

## PERSPECTIVE ESSAYS

247 Terminal Patients and the Right to Refuse Medical Treatment in Argentina *Martín Hevia and Daniela Schnidrig* 

## **BOOK REVIEWS**

- 251 Rethinking Health and Human Rights through Emancipatory Frameworks around Dignity and Well-being *Beatriz Galli*
- 255 Advancing Global Health and Human Rights in this Neoliberal Era *Gillian MacNaughton*

### LETTERS TO THE EDITOR

- 261 Lessons from Jonathan Mann: The Ten Commandments on Multidrug-Resistant TB *Michael Kirby*
- 265 Moving the Debate Forward in Right to Health Litigation *Octavio Luiz Motta Ferraz*
- 269 Response: On the Heterogeneity and Politics of the Judicialization of Health in Brazil *João Biehl, Mariana P. Socal, Joseph J. Amon*