

# HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

An International Journal

VOL. 7 NO. 2

## SPECIAL FOCUS: SEXUALITY, HUMAN RIGHTS, AND HEALTH

### Editorials

- KEEPING THE CONNECTIONS IN 2004. . . . . *Sofia Gruskin*  
SEXUALITY, HUMAN RIGHTS, AND HEALTH  
. . . . . *Alice M. Miller and Carole S. Vance*

### Articles

- SEXUALITY, VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN, AND HUMAN RIGHTS: Women Make Demands and Ladies Get Protection . . . . . *Alice M. Miller*  
BRACKETING SEXUALITY: Human Rights and Sexual Orientation—A Decade of Development and Denial at the UN. . . . . *Ignacio Saiz*  
(DIS)CONTINUITIES OF CUSTOM IN ZIMBABWE AND SOUTH AFRICA: The Implications for Gendered and Sexual Rights . . . . . *Oliver Phillips*  
WHEN DOCTORS TORTURE: The Anus and the State in Egypt and Beyond . . . . . *Scott Long*  
THE ARTICULATION OF RIGHTS AROUND SEXUALITY AND HEALTH: Subaltern Queer Cultures in India in the Era of Hindutva . . . . . *Arvind Narrain*

### Commentaries

- NOT YOUR AVERAGE SEX STORY: Critical Issues in Recent Reporting on Human Rights and Sexuality . . . . . *Cynthia Rothschild*  
PROHIBITING SEX WORK PROJECTS, RESTRICTING WOMEN'S RIGHTS: The International Impact of the 2003 U.S. Global AIDS Act . . *Penelope Saunders*  
INTERROGATING THE ABSENCE OF HIV/AIDS INTERVENTIONS FOR MIGRANT SEX WORKERS IN SOUTH KOREA . . . . . *Sealing Cheng*  
SEXUALITY SCHOLARSHIP AS A FOUNDATION FOR CHANGE: *Lawrence v. Texas* and the Impact of the Historians' Brief . . . . . *Daniel Hurewitz*  
YOUTH, SEXUALITY, AND HUMAN RIGHTS: Some Reflections from Experience in Mexico. . . . . *Lydia I. Alpízar D. and Marina Bernal G.*

### Case Studies

- SEX WORK AND MIGRATION: The Dangers of Oversimplification—A Case Study of Vietnamese Women in Cambodia . . . . . *Joanna Busza*  
INTEGRATING RIGHTS-BASED APPROACHES INTO COMMUNITY-BASED HEALTH PROJECTS: Experiences from the Prevention of Female Genital Cutting Project in East Africa. . . . . *Susan Igras, Jacinta Muteshi, Asmelash WoldeMariam, and Saida Ali*

### Bibliography

- SEXUALITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS. . . . . *Susana T. Fried*



HARVARD SCHOOL OF PUBLIC HEALTH  
François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for  
Health and Human Rights

*Founded through support of the Association François-Xavier Bagnoud*



## François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights

The François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights was founded at the Harvard School of Public Health in January 1993. The Center considers the promotion and protection of health and the promotion and protection of human rights to be inextricably linked. The Center is dedicated to exploring the conceptual dimensions and practical applications of this critical relationship. Through its concentrated focus on the intersection of health and human rights, the Center also seeks to help revitalize the field of public health and broaden human rights thinking and practice.

## Harvard School of Public Health

The Harvard School of Public Health includes more than 200 faculty members working in various disciplines of public health. The overriding mission of the School — to advance the public's health through learning and discovery — comprises four objectives: to educate scientists, professionals, and leaders in public health; to foster new discoveries and develop better technologies for improved health of individuals and populations; to inform and influence debate on key public health issues; and to strengthen capacities and services that meet health needs in the community.

## Association François-Xavier Bagnoud

The Association François-Xavier Bagnoud currently supports worldwide programs in humanitarian assistance, aerospace research for the benefit of people, and community life in the Swiss canton of Valais. Humanitarian assistance focuses on children's rights — especially the right to medical care — of children who are orphaned, abandoned, or sick, many of whom have AIDS or are HIV-infected. Projects are located in Thailand, India, Switzerland, Kenya, Uganda, Uruguay, Colombia, and the United States. The Association François-Xavier Bagnoud bears the name of a young Swiss helicopter rescue pilot who died in a helicopter accident while flying over the desert in Mali in 1986.

# HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

## An International Journal

VOL. 7 NO. 2

**Editor: Sofia Gruskin**  
**Co-Editors: Alice M. Miller and Carole S. Vance**

### Editorials

- KEEPING THE CONNECTIONS IN 2004 ..... 1  
*SOFIA GRUSKIN*
- SEXUALITY, HUMAN RIGHTS, AND HEALTH ..... 5  
*ALICE M. MILLER AND CAROLE S. VANCE*

### Articles

- SEXUALITY, VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN, AND HUMAN RIGHTS: WOMEN MAKE DEMANDS AND LADIES GET PROTECTION ..... 16  
*ALICE M. MILLER*
- BRACKETING SEXUALITY: HUMAN RIGHTS AND SEXUAL ORIENTATION—A DECADE OF DEVELOPMENT AND DENIAL AT THE UN. .... 48  
*IGNACIO SAIZ*
- (DIS)CONTINUITIES OF CUSTOM IN ZIMBABWE AND SOUTH AFRICA: THE IMPLICATIONS FOR GENDERED AND SEXUAL RIGHTS ..... 82  
*OLIVER PHILLIPS*
- WHEN DOCTORS TORTURE: THE ANUS AND THE STATE IN EGYPT AND BEYOND . . . 114  
*SCOTT LONG*
- THE ARTICULATION OF RIGHTS AROUND SEXUALITY AND HEALTH: SUBALTERN QUEER CULTURES IN INDIA IN THE ERA OF HINDUTVA ..... 142  
*ARVIND NARRAIN*

### Commentaries

- NOT YOUR AVERAGE SEX STORY: CRITICAL ISSUES IN RECENT REPORTING ON HUMAN RIGHTS AND SEXUALITY ..... 165  
*CYNTHIA ROTHSCHILD*
- PROHIBITING SEX WORK PROJECTS, RESTRICTING WOMEN'S RIGHTS: THE INTERNATIONAL IMPACT OF THE 2003 U.S. GLOBAL AIDS ACT. .... 179  
*PENELOPE SAUNDERS*
- INTERROGATING THE ABSENCE OF HIV/AIDS INTERVENTIONS FOR MIGRANT SEX WORKERS IN SOUTH KOREA ..... 193  
*SEALING CHENG*
- SEXUALITY SCHOLARSHIP AS A FOUNDATION FOR CHANGE: LAWRENCE V. TEXAS AND THE IMPACT OF THE HISTORIANS' BRIEF. .... 205  
*DANIEL HUREWITZ*
- YOUTH, SEXUALITY, AND HUMAN RIGHTS: SOME REFLECTIONS FROM EXPERIENCE IN MEXICO ..... 217  
*LYDIA I. ALPÍZAR D. AND MARINA BERNAL G.*

### Case Studies

- SEX WORK AND MIGRATION: THE DANGERS OF OVERSIMPLIFICATION—A CASE STUDY OF VIETNAMESE WOMEN IN CAMBODIA. .... 231  
*JOANNA BUSZA*
- INTEGRATING RIGHTS-BASED APPROACHES INTO COMMUNITY-BASED HEALTH PROJECTS: EXPERIENCES FROM THE PREVENTION OF FEMALE GENITAL CUTTING PROJECT IN EAST AFRICA ..... 251  
*SUSAN IGRAS, JACINTA MUTESHI, ASMELASH WOLDEMARIAM, AND SAIDA ALI*

### Bibliography

- SEXUALITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS. .... 273  
*SUSANA T. FRIED*

*Copyright © 2004 by the President and Fellows of Harvard College.*

*Health and Human Rights* is a peer-reviewed international journal dedicated to studying the relationships between human rights and health. The journal examines the effects of human rights violations on health; the impacts of health policies on human rights; and the inextricable nature of the relationship between the promotion and protection of health and the promotion and protection of human rights.

#### **PUBLICATION POLICY**

*Health and Human Rights* welcomes unsolicited manuscripts. Authors should send their manuscripts to the Editorial Office at the address below. Guidelines for authors can be found in the back of this issue and at [www.hsph.harvard.edu](http://www.hsph.harvard.edu) or obtained by writing to the Editorial Office. Issues of international impact and significance for health and human rights are of particular interest.

Views expressed in the journal are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of *Health and Human Rights* officers, editors, or other members.

#### **EDITORIAL/SUBSCRIPTION OFFICE**

*Health and Human Rights*  
Harvard School of Public Health  
François-Xavier Bagnoud Building  
651 Huntington Avenue, 7th Floor  
Boston, MA 02115, USA  
[fxbcenter@igc.apc.org](mailto:fxbcenter@igc.apc.org)  
[www.hsph.harvard.edu/fxbcenter/journal](http://www.hsph.harvard.edu/fxbcenter/journal)  
Tel: (1) 617.432.4611  
Fax: (1) 617.432.4310

#### **ABSTRACTING AND INDEXING**

*Health and Human Rights* is abstracted and indexed in ASSIA: *Applied Social Science Index and Abstracts*; *Geographical Abstracts: Human Geography*; *International Bibliography of the Health Sciences*; *International Development Abstracts*; *A Matter of Fact*; *MEDLINE*, *PAIS International*; *Periodica Islamica*; *Social Planning/Policy and Development Abstracts*; and *Sociological Abstracts*.

*Health and Human Rights* is published twice a year.

---

#### **SUBSCRIPTION AND PURCHASE RATES (in U.S. dollars)**

	2 issues (1 year)	4 issues (2 years)
Students	\$20	\$35
Individuals	\$28	\$45
Institutions	\$60	\$110
Individual Sponsorship	\$34/\$68/\$102	

[Sponsorship helps subsidize free distribution in developing countries.]

Individuals in developing countries may qualify for a free 4-issue subscription by writing a letter of request to the Subscription Office.

Single and back issues are \$15, including postage.

**FOREIGN POSTAGE:** Canada, add \$6/2 issues plus 7% GST (#042103580). All other foreign, add \$8/2 issues.

---

*Health and Human Rights* (ISSN 1079-0969) is published by the François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights of the Harvard School of Public Health.

∞ This paper meets the requirements of ANSI/ISO Z39.48-1992  
(Permanence of paper)

# HEALTH AND HUMAN RIGHTS

## **Editor**

Sofia Gruskin

## **Senior Advisory Board**

Philip Alston  
Hina Jilani  
Halfdan Mahler

V. Ramalingaswami  
Henry Steiner  
Katarina Tomaševski

## **Editorial Board**

Sunila Abeysekera  
Manuel Carballo  
Lincoln Chen  
Ernest Drucker  
Paul Epstein  
Richard Feachem  
Harvey Fineberg  
Julio Frenk  
H. Jack Geiger  
Lawrence Gostin  
Mirko D. Grmek  
Timothy Harding  
Aart Hendriks  
Hakima Himmich  
Emmanuel Hirsch  
Howard Hu  
Peter Kandela  
Michael D. Kirby  
Slobodan Lang  
John F. Lauerma  
Maureen Law  
Jennifer Leaning

Ana Luisa Liguori  
Adetokunbo O. Lucas  
Stephen P. Marks  
Gerald Nagler  
Aryeh Neier  
Richard Parker  
Geneviève Pinet  
Peter Piot  
Jacqueline Pitanguy  
Olikoye Ransome-Kuti  
Jon E. Rohde  
Renée Sabatier  
Amartya Sen  
Gracelyn Smallwood  
Margaret A. Somerville  
Eric Stover  
Donna Sullivan  
Daniel Tarantola  
Lorenzo Tomatis  
Nahid Toubia  
Laurie Wiseberg

## **Founding Editor**

Jonathan Mann 1947–1998

**Managing Editor:** M. Warren Hancock

**Assistant Editor:** Lynn Martin

**Editorial Assistants:** Amy Flick and Jonathan Burton-Macleod

**Design and Layout:** Catlin Rockman