

Methods and Case Studies Workshop

November 2 and 3, 2017

Harvard University
Joseph B. Martin Conference Center
77 Avenue Louis Pasteur
Boston, MA 02115

Benefit-Cost Analysis Reference Case Guidance Project
Funded by the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation

<https://sites.sph.harvard.edu/bcaguidelines/>



Welcome

Dear Colleagues,

We are delighted to welcome you to our Methods and Case Studies Workshop, where we will be exploring approaches for assessing the benefits and costs of policies that aim to improve health and development globally. The experts gathered here will inform the creation of reference case guidance to increase the use of benefit-cost analysis, improve its application, and enhance comparability across analyses. This workshop is funded by the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation as part of a project to develop principles, methodological specifications, and reporting standards to guide the conduct of benefit-cost analysis. At this workshop, we will discuss the draft methods papers and case studies that will provide the foundation for these guidelines, including their initial recommendations and next steps. More information on the project is available on our website: <https://sites.sph.harvard.edu/bcguidelines/>.

The overall program includes the following; all events will be held at the Joseph B. Martin Conference Center (77 Avenue Louis Pasteur, Boston, MA 02115).

- Thursday, November 2:
 - Breakfast will be available starting at 8:00 AM.
 - The technical program begins at 8:30 AM and concludes at 5:30 PM.
 - The reception begins at 5:30 PM and ends at 7:00 PM, and includes remarks from special guest Sue Goldie.
- Friday, November 3:
 - Breakfast will be available starting at 8:00 AM.
 - The technical program begins at 8:30 AM and concludes at 12:30 PM, and features a conversation with Lawrence H. Summers and Dean Jamison.

We are very grateful for your willingness to contribute to these important discussions. We would particularly like to thank the authors and discussants for their hard work, substantial support, and thoughtful advice. We also thank the members of our Advisory Group for their many important contributions throughout this project: Michele Cecchini (OECD), Kalipso Chalkidou (Imperial College London, Center for Global Development), Maureen Cropper (University of Maryland), Anil Deolalikar (University of California – Riverside), David Evans (The World Bank), Frederico Guanais (IADB), Soonman Kwon (University of Seoul), Jeremy Lauer (WHO), Dale Whittington (University of North Carolina), and Brad Wong (Copenhagen Consensus Center). In addition, we are deeply grateful to our Program Officer, David Wilson (Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation) for his leadership and guidance, to Tommy Wilkinson (PRICELESS SA) for helping to coordinate our work with the work of the iDSI Reference Case team, and to Karl Claxton (University of York) for collaborating on issues related to discounting and other methods. Finally, we thank the Harvard Center for Health Decision Science staff, especially Lucy O’Keeffe, Cristina Munk, and Christine Bell, for their excellent help and support.

Best,
Lisa

On behalf of the Leadership Team: Lisa A. Robinson and James K. Hammitt (Harvard University, Center for Health Decision Science and Center for Risk Analysis), Dean Jamison (University of California – San Francisco), and David de Ferranti (Results for Development Institute)

Special Guests

We are very pleased to welcome our special guests speakers.

[Lawrence H. Summers](#) is the Charles W. Eliot University Professor and President Emeritus of Harvard University. During the past two decades, he has served in a series of senior policy positions, including the 71st Secretary of the Treasury for President Clinton, Director of the National Economic Council for President Obama, and Chief Economist of the World Bank.

Summers received a Bachelor of Science degree from the MIT in 1975 and was awarded a Ph.D. from Harvard in 1982. In 1983, he became one of the youngest individuals to be named as a tenured member of the Harvard faculty. Dr. Summers was the first social scientist to receive the Alan T. Waterman Award of the National Science Foundation and was awarded the John Bates Clark Medal.

During the 1990s, he was a leader in crafting the U.S. response to international financial crises arising in Mexico, Brazil, Russia, Japan, and Asian emerging markets. He chairs the boards of Citizen Schools and the Center for Global Development. He led the Lancet Commission on Global Health, lauded by the UN Secretary General as bringing “more than health – it will bring equity, and contribute to a life of dignity for all.”

[Dean Jamison](#) is Professor Emeritus of Global Health at the University of California, San Francisco. He previously served as Professor of Global Health at the University of Washington (2008-2013) and as the T. & G. Angelopoulos Visiting Professor of Public Health and International Development in the Harvard Kennedy School and the Harvard School of Public Health (2006-2008). Prior to that, Jamison was at the University of California, Los Angeles (1988-2006) and the World Bank (1976-1988). His last position at the World Bank was Director, World Development Report Office and he was the lead author for the Bank’s 1993 World Development Report, Investing in Health.

In 1994, Jamison was elected to membership in the National Academy of Medicine. He was recently co-first author with Lawrence Summers of ‘Global Health 2035’, the report of The Lancet Commission on Investing in Health and is the Principal Investigator and a lead editor of the Disease Control Priorities Project. Jamison studied at Stanford (M.S., Engineering Science) and at Harvard (Ph.D., Economics, under K.J. Arrow).

[Sue J. Goldie](#) is the Roger Irving Lee Professor of Public Health and serves as the Director of both the Center for Health Decision Science, Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health (2009-) and the Global Health Education and Learning Incubator at Harvard University (2015-). She served as the founding Director of the Harvard Global Health Institute (2010-2015).

Her research has influenced clinical guidelines, health policy, and priority setting in low-, middle-, and high-income countries. She was awarded a MacArthur grant “for genius and creativity” (2005) in applying decision analytic methods to public health and the John Eisenberg Award for translation of research to practice (2008), and was elected to the National Academy of Sciences (2009).

Goldie has catalyzed cross-sectoral collaboration beyond the university, played key roles in initiatives such as *The Lancet* Commission on Investing in Health, and infused global health perspectives into educational opportunities across schools. Piloting creative pedagogy, Goldie has developed courses in decision science and population health for undergraduates and graduates, and has received more than a dozen teaching and mentorship awards.

Dr. Goldie attended Union College (BS, 1984), Albany Medical College (MD, 1988, Alpha Omega Alpha Honor Medical Society), Yale University School of Medicine (Internal Medicine, 1988-1991), and the Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health (MPH, 1997). She joined the faculty in 1998 and received tenure in 2006.

Workshop Agenda

Thursday, November 2

- 8:30-9:00 **Welcome and Introduction**
- David Wilson and Lisa A. Robinson
- 9:00-10:00 **Valuing Mortality Risk Reductions** (Chair: Lynn Karoly)
- Lead Authors: Lisa A. Robinson and James K. Hammitt
 - Discussants: Anna Alberini, Maureen Cropper
- 10:00-10:15 **Break**
- 10:15-11:15 **Valuing Nonfatal Health Risk Reductions** (Chair: Peter Neumann)
- Lead Authors: Lisa A. Robinson and James K. Hammitt
 - Discussants: Mark Dickie, Montarat Thavorncharoensap
- 11:15-12:15 **Assessing Economy-wide Effects** (Chair: David de Ferranti)
- Lead Authors: Kenneth Strzepek, Collins Amanya, and James E. Neumann
 - Discussants: Channing Arndt, Anil Deolalikar
- 12:15-1:30 **Lunch**
- 1:30-2:30 **Assessing the Distribution of Impacts** (Chair: Stéphane Verguet)
- Lead Authors: Lisa A. Robinson and James K. Hammitt, with supplement by Matthew Adler
 - Discussants: Neal Fann, Sam Harper
- 2:30-3:30 **Discounting Future Impacts** (Chair: Maureen Cropper)
- Lead Author: Karl Claxton
 - Discussants: Miqdad Asaria, Gernot Wagner
- 3:30-3:45 **Break**
- 3:45-5:15 **Case Studies** (Chair: Frederico Guanais)
- Education: Elina Pradhan and Dean Jamison
 - Stunting: Brad Wong and Peter F. Orazem
 - Discussants: Anil Deolalikar, Lynn Karoly, Roger Perman, George Psacharopoulos
- 5:15-5:30 **Wrap-up**
- 5:30-7:00 **Reception with remarks from Sue Goldie**

Friday, November 3

- 8:30-9:00 **Welcome and Recap**
- 9:00-10:00 **A Conversation with Dean Jamison and Lawrence H. Summers**
- 10:00-10:15 **Break**
- 10:15-11:15 **Valuing Changes in Time Use** (Chair: Brad Wong)
- Lead Authors: Dale Whittington and Joseph Cook
 - Discussants: Abusaleh Shariff, James E. Neumann
- 11:15-12:15 **Valuing Protection against Health-Related Financial Risks** (Chair: Michele Cecchini)
- Lead Authors: Dean Jamison and Jonathan Skinner
 - Discussants: Kalipso Chalkidou, Mark Shepard
- 12:15-12:30 **Wrap-up and Adjourn**

Speakers

[Anna Alberini](#) is a Professor at the University of Maryland, where she specializes in the assessment and economic valuation of health effects and other aspects of environmental and energy policies. Her work is primarily applied, using data collected by government agencies and utilities as well as her own surveys of individuals and households. She has conducted survey work in the U.S., Canada, Italy, Armenia, and Ukraine, as well as several other countries.

[Collins Amany](#) is a Principal Economist at the Ministry of Water and Environment, Government of Uganda-Kampala, where he is affiliated with planning and budgeting for public water supply and environment services. His research focuses on valuing water and environmental services and their contribution to the economic development of Uganda's economy, including establishing the value of water and environmental resources in relationship to the national gross domestic product.

[Channing Arndt](#) is a Senior Research Fellow in the Development Strategy and Governance Division of the International Food Policy Research Institute. He has more than 25 years of experience in development economics. His recent books include *Growth and Poverty in Sub-Saharan Africa*, *Measuring Poverty and Wellbeing in Developing Countries*, and *the Political Economy of Clean Energy Transitions*. His work includes effectively building institutional capacity in developing countries.

[Miqdad Asaria](#) is a Health Economist based in Delhi, India and is affiliated with the Global Health and Development Group at Imperial College London and the Centre for Health Economics at the University of York. In India, he has focused on providing health economics support to the Department of Health Research under the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. His research explores methods for quantitatively incorporating equity concerns in the context of health care resource allocation.

[Michele Cecchini](#) is a senior health economist and policy analyst in the OECD Health Division where he leads the Public Health program. His research interests include priority-setting and program evaluation of policies influencing population health, in particular with regards to the health and economic assessment of cross-sectoral public health policies. He is an adjunct professor in applied health economics at the School of Public Health of the University of Siena.

[Kalipso Chalkidou](#) is the Director for Health Policy and Senior Fellow at the Center for Global Development and a Professor of Practice in Global Health at Imperial College London. As the principal investigator on the International Decision Support Initiative (iDSI), she has been involved in the development of the iDSI Reference Case for economic evaluation and is engaged with several projects across low- and middle-income countries, supporting national payers in making healthcare allocation decisions.

[Karl Claxton](#) is a Professor at the Centre for Health Economics and the Department of Economics at the University of York. He was a founding member of the National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (NICE) Technology Appraisal Committee, contributing to the development of the NICE Methods Guide and the International Decision Support Initiative (iDSI) Reference Case for Economic Evaluation.

[Maureen Cropper](#) is Distinguished University Professor and Chair of the University of Maryland Department of Economics. She is also a Senior Fellow at Resources for the Future, a Research Associate of the National Bureau of Economic Research, and a member of the National Academy of Sciences. She served as a Lead Economist in the World Bank's Research Department, 1993-2006, and was a member of the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency's Science Advisory Board, 1994-2006.

[Anil Deolalikar](#) is Professor of Economics and Founding Dean of the School of Public Policy at the University of California, Riverside. A development economist, he has published extensively on child nutrition, health, education, poverty, and social protection. He co-edits *The Journal of Asian and African Studies* and *The Journal of Developing Societies*, is a Fellow of the American Association for the Advancement of Science, and chairs the Board of Directors of the University of California Global Health Institute.

Mark Dickie is Professor of Economics at the University of Central Florida. His research focuses on estimating the economic benefits of reducing risks to human health, understanding how people perceive health risks, and examining the determinants and effects of actions that people take that affect the risks they experience.

Neal Fann is a policy analyst in the Office of Air and Radiation at the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, where he leads a team of risk assessors and economists who use the BenMAP-CE software program to quantify the incidence and economic value of air pollution-related deaths and illnesses. His research explores how equitably air pollution risk is distributed across population subgroups in the U.S. and internationally.

David de Ferranti is Board Chair of The Results for Development Institute (R4D), and its founder and former CEO. His previous roles have included: Senior Fellow at the Brookings Institution, Vice-President at the World Bank, visiting professor at Georgetown and Harvard Universities, and program director at RAND. His work focuses on global health and education, and implementation of innovative initiatives to reduce poverty and improve well-being in developing countries.

Frederico Guanais is the Principal Health Specialist at the Inter-American Development Bank, where he is responsible for the design, supervision, and evaluation of loan operations, and for providing policy advice in the health sector in several countries in Latin America and the Caribbean. He research addresses health system strengthening, primary health care, patient-centered care, integration of health and social services, policy responses to chronic diseases, and health policy in Brazil.

James K. Hammitt is Professor of Economics and Decision Sciences at the Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, where he is affiliated with the Center for Health Decision Science and directs the Harvard Center for Risk Analysis. He is also affiliated with the Toulouse School of Economics. His research concerns the development and application of quantitative methods for evaluating health and environmental policies.

Sam Harper is an Associate Professor in the Department of Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Occupational Health and affiliated with the Institute for Health and Social Policy and the Centre on Population Dynamics at McGill University. His research focuses on the impact that social and economic factors have on health, with specific interest in impact evaluation, quasi-experimental methods, and health inequalities.

Lynn A. Karoly is a senior economist at the RAND Corporation and the current President of the Society for Benefit-Cost Analysis. Her expertise includes the application of benefit-cost analysis and related economic evaluation tools to areas of social policy. She served on the National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine committee that produced *Advancing the Power of Economic Evidence to Inform Investments in Children, Youth, and Families* (2016).

James E. Neumann is a Principal and an applied economist at Industrial Economics, a consultancy in Cambridge, MA. His research focuses on the economics of air pollution and climate change impacts and adaptation, in the U.S., Africa, Eastern Europe, and small island nations. He was a lead author for the IPCC Fifth Assessment and the most recent National Climate Assessment.

Peter J. Neumann is Director of the Center for the Evaluation of Value and Risk in Health at the Institute for Clinical Research and Health Policy Studies at Tufts Medical Center, and Professor of Medicine at Tufts University School of Medicine. He has written widely about cost-effectiveness analysis in health care, and served as co-chair of the 2nd Panel on Cost-Effectiveness in Health and Medicine.

Roger Perman is Reader in Economics at the University of Strathclyde, U.K.. He has extensive experience in the economic appraisal of projects, programs, and policies, particularly in the areas of environment, energy, and development. He has been a consultant to and trainer of economists for the U.K. Department for International Development, and is a Visiting Professor at the University of Rennes, France.

George Psacharopoulos is Adjunct Professor at Georgetown University. He is also affiliated with the CESifo research group at the University of Munich. His research focuses on the role of education in economic and social development.

[Lisa A. Robinson](#) is a Senior Research Scientist at the Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health, where she is affiliated with the Center for Health Decision Science and the Center for Risk Analysis. Her research focuses on the conduct of benefit-cost analysis, particularly for policies with outcomes that cannot be fully valued using market measures. She was a member of the founding Board as well as Past President of the Society for Benefit-Cost Analysis.

[Abusaleh Shariff](#) is the Executive Director of the U.S.-India Policy Institute and has over 30 years of academic and policy oriented experience, mostly as chief economist at the National Council for Applied Economic Research, New Delhi. He was an adviser to the Indian Prime Minister during 2005-2007 as member-secretary of Sachar Report; and to the Ministry of Home Affairs. An empiricist and human development economist, he has authored or edited over 12 books.

[Mark Shepard](#) is an Assistant Professor at Harvard Kennedy School of Government and a faculty research fellow at the National Bureau of Economic Research. His research addresses health care markets, focusing on topics at the intersection of health, industrial organization, and public economics. Much of his work addresses competition and policy design in health insurance markets, particularly in public programs such as the Affordable Care Act and Medicaid.

[Jonathan S. Skinner](#) is the James O. Freedman Presidential Chair in economics at Dartmouth College, and a professor at the Dartmouth Institute for Health Policy and Clinical Practice, Geisel School of Medicine. His research focuses on technology growth and diffusion in health care, regional variations in health care utilization and outcomes, and the savings behavior of aging baby-boomers.

[Kenneth M. Strzepek](#) is a Research Scientist at MIT's Joint Program on the Science and Policy of Climate Change, Adjunct Professor of Public Policy at Harvard's Kennedy School of Government, and Professor Emeritus at the University of Colorado. His research spans water resources engineering, climate science, and applied economics, and currently focuses on integrating economy-wide economic modeling with biophysical and health effects analyses to inform decisions in developing countries.

[Montarat Thavorncharoensap](#) is an Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Pharmacy, Mahidol University. She was previously a researcher for the Health Intervention and Technology Assessment program in Thailand. Her work focuses on studies of willingness-to-pay, costs of illness, and quality of life. She has been involved in the research on willingness-to-pay for a quality-adjusted life year (QALY) in Asia.

[Stéphane Verguet](#) is Assistant Professor of Global Health in the Department of Global Health and Population at the Harvard T.H. Chan School of Public Health. Dr. Verguet's multidisciplinary research focuses on health decision science and priority setting, through the development of mathematical and computational decision-making models. He is currently working on the distributional consequences and estimation of non-health benefits of health policies and interventions.

[Gernot Wagner](#) is a research associate and lecturer at Harvard, co-director of Harvard's Solar Geoengineering Research Program, and co-author of *Climate Shock*.

[Dale Whittington](#) is Professor of Environmental Sciences and Engineering and City and Regional Planning at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill and also a Professor at the Alliance Manchester Business School, University of Manchester. His research focuses on water policy and nonmarket valuation methods. With Dr. Duncan Thomas, he offers two massive open online courses on water supply and sanitation policy in developing countries.

[David Wilson](#) is a Senior Program Officer in Decision Sciences and Optimization at the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, Adjunct Professor of Allocative Efficiency at the Burnet Institute, and founder of the Optima Consortium for Decision Science. He works on the creation and use of public goods for decision-making in health and development in low- and middle-income countries.

[Brad Wong](#) is the Chief Economist of the Copenhagen Consensus Center, where he manages all aspects of the Center's research agenda. In this role he works with some of the world's leading economists to undertake cost-benefit analysis across a vast array of development areas. His work focuses on encouraging effective and evidence-based approaches to development spending that achieve maximum social good.

