

Accelerating Patterns of Anti-Roma Violence in Hungary

Boston, February 2014

A Report from the François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights

Harvard School of Public Health and Harvard University

Table of Contents

About the FXB Center at Harvard	4
Report Contributors	6
Glossary/Abbreviations	6
1. Executive summary and recommendations	7
2. The work of the FXB Center to promote Roma rights	11
3. Methodology of the report	12
4. Political landscape and demographics of Roma in Hungary	13
Political Landscape	13
Demographics of the Roma in Hungary	13
5. Findings	15
5.1. Inter-group relations, including record of discrimination and/or other human rights violations committed against a group	15
Education	16
Health.....	18
Housing.....	19
Employment.....	19
5.2. History of genocide or related serious and massive human rights violations against a particular group	20
The Holocaust.....	20
Patterns of impunity and lack of accountability for past crimes committed against targeted groups	21
5.3. Circumstances that hamper the capacity to prevent genocide	21
Existing structures, effectiveness, risks	21
Summary	23
5.4. Motivation of leading actors in the State; acts which serve to encourage divisions between national, racial, ethnic, and religious groups	23
Creation of paramilitary, militia, vigilant groups, and extreme right organizations	23
Summary	26
The use of exclusionary ideology and the construction of identities in terms of “us” and “them” to accentuate differences.....	27
Summary	28

5.5. Development of events that suggest a trajectory towards the perpetration of violence ..	28
Racially motivated crimes, violence and attacks	28
Summary	36
Military trainings	37
Summary	38
5.6 Other triggering factors for violence	38
Events amounting to hate speech and hate crimes, especially by leaders and organized groups, leads to an inflammatory atmosphere and insecurity	38
Summary	42
5.7 Final conclusions.....	42
5.8 Recommendations	43

About the FXB Center at Harvard

The FXB Center for Health and Human Rights at Harvard University is an interdisciplinary center that works to protect and promote the rights and wellbeing of children, adolescents, youth and their families trapped in extreme circumstances throughout the world. The Center pursues this goal by conducting and supporting research, advocacy, and targeted action.



New members are shown being inducted into the Hungarian Guard, a paramilitary, racist, extremist organization that was dissolved by the Hungarian courts in December 2008 for activities that infringed upon the Roma people's right to freedom and security. *Credit: Photo taken from "Without a Chance," a documentary produced by the Hungarian Civil Liberties Union and released on January 7, 2014. The documentary can be viewed [here](#).*

Report Contributors

FXB Center for Health and Human Rights, Harvard University: Jennifer Leaning, Jacqueline Bhabha, Arlan Fuller, Margareta Matache, Bonnie Shnayerson and Carrie Bronshter

Harvard University: Jelena Ivanis and Katalin Dobias

Glossary/Abbreviations

EU: European Union

ECHR: European Court of Human Rights

ECRI: European Commission against Racism and Intolerance

EPP: European People's Party

ERRC: European Roma Rights Centre

FIDESZ: Federation of Young Democrats–Hungarian Civic Alliance

FRA: Fundamental Rights Agency

FXB Center: François Xavier Bagnoud (FXB) Center for Health and Human Rights

JOBBIK: The Movement for a Better Hungary

KDNP: Christian Democratic People's Party

NPFHCGA: The Association for a Better Future Civil Guard

OSCE: Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe

UN: United Nations

1. Executive summary and recommendations

Accelerating patterns of anti-Roma violence in Hungary aims to alert the United Nations Office of the Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide and other intergovernmental bodies to the persistent patterns of violent attacks and actions against the Roma in Hungary.

Throughout the report, the François-Xavier Bagnoud Center for Health and Human Rights at Harvard University (the FXB Center) argues that the recrudescence of hate crimes, racist propaganda, discrimination, and exclusionary ideologies indicates a need for vigorous early assessment of the risk of violence and for measures to ensure the physical and psychological safety of the Roma and other minority groups. The report focuses predominantly on factual data gathered by different national and international stakeholders, and it recounts instances of violence, killings, military trainings, and propaganda against the Roma minority in Hungary. A limitation of the report is that it describes actions only against the Roma population. A broader examination of existing extremist tendencies in Hungary should also consider violence against the Jewish community and other minority groups.

Experts on genocide prevention have posited various perspectives and definitions that should be considered in the context of genocide analysis. Barbara Harff defines the pre-genocidal stage as marked by the “emergence of vigilante groups, increased police brutality, increased military involvement in civil affairs, increased human rights violations and ideological encroachment on judicial decisions.”¹ Yehuda Bauer suggests that the existence of “overwhelming power” concentrated in the hands of one party is central to the act of genocide, whereas in conflicts, no single party has the power to wage a campaign of total destruction against its enemies.² Thus the essential underpinnings for peace and stability, according to Jennifer Leaning, FXB Center Director and expert on genocide prevention, are: “good governance, the rule of law, economic development and reduction of inequality, human rights, and adequate health and education.”³

In the last five years in Hungary, the establishment of vigilante groups and hate crimes against Roma and other minority groups has characterized a climate of increasing social and economic exclusion. Despite the adoption of European Union (EU) anti-discrimination regulations and laws,⁴ extremist

¹ Barbara Harff, *Countries at risk of genocide and politicide in 2012*. In: *Guiding principles of the emerging architecture aiming at the prevention of genocide, war crime, and crimes against humanity*, Genocide prevention advisory net, p. 5-13, 2012.

² Yehuda Bauer, *Holocaust Education and Genocide Prevention*, in *Guiding principles of the emerging architecture aiming at the prevention of genocide, war crime, and crimes against humanity*, Genocide prevention advisory net, p. 127-143, 2012.

³ Jennifer Leaning, *Preventing Mass Atrocity: Situational Awareness at the National Level*, conference presentation, 2013.

⁴ Applicable EU Anti-Discrimination Framework:

- *Racial Equality Directive*: Council Directive 2000/43/EC of 29 June 2000 implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of racial or ethnic origin (2000)
<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:32000L0043:en:HTML>. Accessed on January 28, 2014.
- *Employment Equality Directive*: Council Directive 2000/78/EC of 27 November 2000 establishing a general framework for equal treatment in employment and occupation (2000).

organizations, private individuals, and state officials in Hungary continue to widely and openly discriminate against Roma at an alarming rate and through a variety of methods:

- State officials and members of mainstream parties often use racist public statements that incite hate against the Roma and other minority groups.
- Extreme right parties are consolidating their power. The most visible party is the Jobbik Party, whose 47 seats have made it the third largest group in the Hungarian Parliament. The Jobbik Party's anti-Roma and anti-Jewish rhetoric and actions have become increasingly virulent in recent years in Hungary, bolstered by organized paramilitary groups, extremist organizations, and private individuals.
- In a bid to prevent "Gypsy crime," recently established paramilitary extremist groups and organizations are increasingly using distinct anti-Roma rhetoric. These groups have organized anti-Roma rallies in several villages and cities. They wear special uniforms with Nazi or nationalistic symbols which create a threatening social environment. During their organized events, these groups have employed anti-Semitic and anti-LGBT rhetoric.
- Extremist organizations hold weapon trainings for members on a regular basis.

<http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:32000L0078:en:HTML> accessed on January 28, 2014

- *EU Charter*: Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union (2000) http://www.europarl.europa.eu/charter/pdf/text_en.pdf accessed on January 28, 2014
- *Framework Decision on Combating Racism and Xenophobia*: Council Framework Decision 2008/913/JHA of 28 November 2008 on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia by means of criminal law <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:32008F0913:en:NOT> accessed on January 28, 2014

Related EU Framework on Roma Inclusion:

- *Economic and Social Integration of the Roma in Europe*: Communication from the Commission to the Council, the European Parliament, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions The social and economic integration of the Roma in Europe (2000) <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:52010DC0133:en:NOT> accessed on January 28, 2014
- *National Roma Integration Strategies by 2020*: Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions: An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020 (2011) <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:52011DC0173:en:NOT> accessed on January 28, 2014
- *Implementation of National Roma Integration Strategies*: Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions: National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework (2012) <http://eur-lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=CELEX:52012DC0226:en:NOT> accessed on January 28, 2014
- *Assessment Report on Implementation*: Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Committee and the Committee of the Regions: Steps forward in Implementing National Roma Integration Strategies (2013) http://ec.europa.eu/justice/discrimination/files/com_2013_454_en.pdf accessed on January 28, 2014

N.B. All examined countries are parties to the *European Convention on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms* (ECHR), therefore, the article 14 and Protocol 12 jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights provides a parallel Council of Europe enforcement mechanism for the protection of the Roma from discrimination. This is of enhanced relevance as the accession of the European Union to the ECHR progresses. Similarly, the applicability of relevant international Conventions, including the *International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination* (CERD) and the reporting, complains and early warning procedures of the CERD Committee are equally applicable in the examined jurisdictions.

- Several instances of racially motivated crimes and violence by both extremists groups and civilians have been recorded by civil society organizations and the media, including the killing or injuring of Roma victims, the use of firearms, firebombs, grenades, and Molotov cocktails against Roma, and the humiliation of Romani children and adults.

This report by the FXB Center identifies these repeated and escalating acts and calls upon the UN Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide, the Hungarian Government, and the EU to take responsibility and act to avoid the dangers that the Roma and other minority groups in Hungary have been exposed to in recent years. The report underlines the need for increased monitoring and actions by the Hungarian Government and intergovernmental bodies to combat extremism, discrimination, and violence against the Roma community:

- The FXB Center encourages the EU to design and implement actions to curb the rise of extremism, not just in Hungary, but across Europe. These efforts include the revision of the current legal and institutional frameworks and the deployment of concrete mechanisms of intervention. According to the Fundamental Rights Agency (FRA) report on hate crime,⁵ Hungary, among other EU countries, did not report any hate crime against Roma or Jews in 2010 despite documented incidences to the contrary. The EU should improve its legislative and institutional mechanisms to ensure Member States' compliance with the requirement of collecting, monitoring and public reporting data on extremism and hate crimes under penalty of law. In May 2013, the EU Commissioner for Home Affairs Cecilia Malmstrom also proposed the adoption of a European Counter Violent Extremism Program,⁶ which provides recommendations for revising the EU Strategy for Combating Radicalization and Recruitment to Terrorism⁷ through measures designed "to help Member States and the EU institutions to better counter violent extremism."⁸
- As the European Court of Human Rights (ECHR) underlined in its decision in the Vona v. Hungary case,⁹ the use of "Gypsy crime" and other similar narratives are racist and meant to feed intolerance and hate. Based on the ECHR decision and on existing Hungarian and EU laws, Hungarian institutions should immediately investigate the legality of extremist organizations and consider their prohibition. The ECHR recognizes that the State has the "obligation to criminalize the dissemination of racism, xenophobia or ethnic intolerance, to prohibit every assembly and dissolve every group, organization, association or party that

⁵ Fundamental Rights Agency, *Making hate crime visible in the European Union: acknowledging victims' rights*, 2012. http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra-2012_hate-crime.pdf.

⁶ *The rise of right-wing extremism in Europe*, June 27, 2013.

Europa.eu/rapid/press-release_SPEECH-13-464_en.htm. Accessed on August 12, 2013.

⁷ Council of the European Union, *The European Union Strategy for Combating Radicalization and Recruitment to Terrorism*, 2005. <http://register.consilium.eu.int/pdf/en/05/st14/st14781-re01.en05.pdf>.

⁸ Radicalization, http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/what-we-do/policies/crisis-and-terrorism/radicalisation/index_en.htm. Accessed on June 4, 2013.

⁹ Case Vona v. Hungary <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/pages/search.aspx?i=001-122183#%7B%22fulltext%22:%5B%22Vona%20v.%20Hungary%22%5D,%22itemid%22:%5B%22001-122183%22%5D%7D>. Accessed on September 4, 2013.

promotes them.”¹⁰ In Hungary, recent legislative changes uniquely position the judiciary to develop the case-law on escalating hate speech and violence against minorities in a way that it is in compliance with international and EU standards as well as the jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights.

- The Fourth Constitutional Amendment to the Hungarian Basic Law, entering into force on April 1, 2014, incorporated a limitation clause to the freedom of expression clause. The amendment in effect overturns the leading freedom of expression case of the Constitutional Court, which stipulated that “the right to freedom of expression protects one’s opinion regardless of the value or veracity of its content...”¹¹ The repeated use of constitutional amendments by the Hungarian parliamentary majority to annul the effect of Constitutional Court decisions remains to be concerning. Yet, this particular change allows the judiciary to employ a balancing test as it prescribes that “... exercising the right to freedom of expression cannot violate the human dignity of others... [and] cannot aim at violating the dignity of the Hungarian nation, national, ethnic, racial or religious communities.”¹² Importantly, the amendment gives standing to members of the affected communities to sue for damages, which was previously only possible if the plaintiffs themselves were targeted by the speech.
- At the same time, the amendment also appears to ensure the constitutionality of a provision of the new Civil Code, entering into force on March 15, 2014, which makes justiciable not only hate speech but any expression that “publicly offends the community or is unnecessarily hurtful in its formulation.”¹³ The broad and undefined meaning of this standard allows for potentially extensive regulation of freedom of speech and expression.
- It is yet to be seen whether the changed legislative environment will serve as a tool for wider protection of minorities or greater restriction on freedom of expression. The Hungarian judiciary will play a crucial role at a critical time to develop a case-law that puts an end to hate speech while upholding human rights and fundamental freedoms necessary in a democratic society. To that end, judges should be given appropriate training on relevant international and EU law, including related ECHR jurisprudence.
- Secret military trainings organized by neo-Nazi groups have been reported by civil society organizations since 2009. Organizing military trainings on weapon usage, combat or urban fighting is illegal, and we call upon the Hungarian Government to ensure security for its citizens by investigating groups and individuals involved in secret combat preparation.

¹⁰ Idem.

¹¹ [unofficial translation] 30/1992. (V. 26.) Constitutional Court decision
http://mediatorveny.hu/dokumentum/14/01_301992_ABH.pdf. Accessed on January 28, 2014.

¹² [unofficial translation] Fourth Amendment to the Basic Law of Hungary No. T/9929/55. (March 6, 2013)
<http://www.parlament.hu/irom39/09929/09929-0055.pdf>. Accessed on January 28, 2014.

¹³ [unofficial translation] 2:54. § (5) of the Act V. of 2013 on the Civil Code of Hungary
http://ptk2013.hu/wp-content/uploads/2013/03/uj_ptk_szov.html#fn1. Accessed on January 28, 2014.

- Only a few cases in Hungary have been considered by the Courts to have racist motivation, even though upwards of 61 incidents were reported by the European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC)¹⁴ between 2008 and 2012. This may be evidence of a serious need to increase awareness among law enforcement personnel of bias indicators and international standards on hate crimes and extremism. Enhanced penalties would appropriately reflect the impact of racially motivated offenses on the individual and the community, and serve as a powerful public deterrent. However, mere adoption of pieces of legislation, no matter how well drafted, is unlikely to have an impact without proper implementation. Implementation is the most important test in combating hate crime and racially motivated violence, and it is this very test that many states in Europe fail, particularly in regard to the Roma.
- In 2012, the Government introduced into the national school curriculum the writings of József Nyíró, who the World Jewish Congress has called “a notorious cultural ideologue under Horthy, who later transferred his allegiance to the Arrow Cross regime which murdered tens of thousands of Jews.”¹⁵ If the Hungarian institutions will consider creating effective preventive anti-bias tools, they should also consider developing educational and mass media tools to prevent the promotion of prejudice and intolerance. Courses and materials on human rights, cultural diversity and the extermination of Roma during the Holocaust in Hungary should be included in teacher training and incorporated into the national school curriculum from the primary to the university level.

2. The work of the FXB Center to promote Roma rights

Founded in 1993, the FXB Center is an interdisciplinary academic center dedicated to advancing the rights and wellbeing of marginalized children, adolescents, youth and their families worldwide.¹⁶ The Center engages local partners, communities, and young people themselves to conduct and support research, teaching, advocacy, and targeted action in the areas of child protection and adolescent empowerment.

The FXB Center is leading an innovative research, advocacy, and capacity-building program centered on two of the most urgent concerns facing the Roma population in Europe today:

- 1) *Promoting the rights and opportunities of Romani children and adolescents.* This work addresses unequal access to education, training and civic engagement opportunities. In 2012, the Center launched “Reclaiming Adolescence: Roma Transitions to Adulthood,” a three-year participatory action research project designed to build intercultural leadership and participation

¹⁴ European Roma Rights Center, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*. <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

¹⁵ WJC, *The rise of neo-Nazism in the Party Political System*, 2013. http://www.worldjewishcongress.org/uploads/neo_Nazi_report.pdf.

¹⁶ FXB Center for Health and Human Rights. <http://fxb.harvard.edu/>.

skills among Roma and non-Roma youths in Serbia, Romania and Italy. Since 2013, the FXB Center has provided research and technical assistance to a transnational network of Roma rights organizations investigating Roma school segregation in Bulgaria, Croatia, the Czech Republic, Greece, Hungary, and Romania.

- 2) *Confronting the escalating climate of anti-Roma violence and extremism.* The economic, social and political developments have fueled a reemergence of violence against the Roma community, including state-sanctioned policies and practices, as well as attacks, hate speech and hate crimes. The FXB Center is working to inform and engage the broader academic community in supporting the efforts of Roma activists, communities and institutions to combat extremism and hate-motivated violence.

3. Methodology of the report

The findings discussed here are based on desk research and field assessments conducted by the Roma program team at the FXB Center. Information derives from documentation by international¹⁷ and local human rights organizations¹⁸ working in Hungary; coverage in the mass media in English and Hungarian; as well as from reports and materials in the public domain published by intergovernmental and national institutions. The report gathers factual data with the aim of identifying and reporting on patterns and instances of violence, killings, military trainings, and propaganda against the Roma. Unless otherwise stated, statistics refer to the Hungarian national context.

The general situation of Roma in Hungary is discussed in the background section of this report. Information on discrimination and social exclusion as well as specific forms of discrimination, including education, employment, health, and housing, are reviewed. While these findings are worrisome, they are reflective of the situation of Roma across Central and Eastern Europe and are not particular to Hungary.

Unique to Hungary is the growing concern over extremism. The formation of paramilitary and vigilante groups who espouse extreme racist ideologies is discussed. This section is followed by a review of these organizations' activities against Roma, including military trainings and racially motivated crimes, violence, and attacks. Other triggering factors for violence are then examined. These developments place the Roma in Hungary in jeopardy of physical harm and create cause for grave concern. Recommendations to address these issues are provided at the end of this report.

The report tracks with the indicators established by the Analysis Framework of the UN Office of the Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide,¹⁹ specifically but not exclusively looking at:

¹⁷ European Roma Rights Centre, Amnesty International, European Network against Racism.

¹⁸ Legal Defense Bureau for National and Ethnic Minorities (NEKI), the Hungarian Civil Liberties Union (TASZ), Helsinki Committee Hungary.

¹⁹ United Nations, *Office of the UN Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide: Analysis Framework*. http://www.un.org/en/preventgenocide/adviser/pdf/osapg_analysis_framework.pdf.

- increase in inflammatory rhetoric or hate propaganda, especially by leaders, that sets a tone of impunity;
- depiction of a targeted group as dangerous, disloyal, a security or economic threat or as unworthy or inferior so as to justify action against the group;
- the use of exclusionary ideology and the construction of identities in terms of “us” and “them” to accentuate differences;
- serious discriminatory practices; and
- significant disparities in socio-economic indicators showing a pattern of deliberate exclusion from economic resources and social and political life.

4. Political landscape and demographics of Roma in Hungary

Political Landscape

Hungary is a parliamentary representative republic, with legislative power held by a 386 seat unicameral parliament.

During the most recent parliamentary elections in 2010, Fidesz (Federation of Young Democrats–Hungarian Civic Alliance) and KDNP (Christian Democratic People's Party) formed a coalition and obtained more than two-thirds of the parliament seats. According to Hungarian law, the coalition holds enough seats to amend or adopt a new constitution without opposition support.²⁰ The coalition won 2.7 million votes, making it the greatest election victory in the country’s democratic history.²¹ Fidesz is a member of the European People's Party (EPP), the largest political group in the European Parliament.²²

Demographics of the Roma in Hungary

The Roma are the largest minority in Hungary. According to the most recent government census in 2011, 308,957 Roma²³ (3.1% of the total Hungarian population of 9,937,628 people) live in Hungary. Civil society organizations estimate that there are between 450,000-1,000,000 (5-10% of the total population) Roma in Hungary but due to fear of stigmatization, discrimination, violence and having experienced the consequences of the Holocaust many Roma do not self-identified.²⁴ The Roma population in age composition is substantially younger than the non-Roma population with 36.8% of

20 Freedom House, Nations in transit. Hungary, 2011. http://www.freedomhouse.org/sites/default/files/inline_images/NIT-2011-Hungary.pdf.

21 Socialists in Hungary Are Ousted in Elections, April 25, 2010.

http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/26/world/europe/26hungary.html?_r=2&. Accessed on June 29, 2013.

22 The long march of Fidesz, January 7, 2012. <http://www.economist.com/node/21542422>. Accessed on June 29, 2013.

23 http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Demographics_of_Hungary#cite_note-75. Accessed on July 3, 2013.

24 The Unseen Powers: Perception, Stigma and Roma Rights, November 20, 2007.

<http://www.errc.org/cikk.php?cikk=2870>. Accessed on July 5, 2013.

the Roma population between 0 and 14 compared to 15.4% of the non-Roma population.²⁵ The main Roma subgroups in Hungary are Romungros, Lovari and Beash.²⁶

The Roma population in Hungary encounters discrimination and exclusion on a regular basis across several sectors, including education, health, employment, housing, and access to other services. The living conditions of the Roma are generally worse than those of the non-Roma population. About 60% of the Roma live in secluded rural areas, segregated neighborhoods, settlements, or ghettos.²⁷ As acknowledged by governmental policy documents, the Roma have limited access to health and education: life expectancy is 10 years less for Roma as compared with the majority population, and less than 20% of young Roma are enrolled in high schools.²⁸ In 2013, the ECHR sanctioned Hungary for the abusive diagnosis and placement of Romani students into schools for children with mental disabilities without objective and reasonable justification.²⁹

At present, there are four elected Roma in the Hungarian Parliament³⁰ and one Roma-held seat supported by Fidesz in the European Parliament.

Since 1993, the Roma along with other minority groups have been permitted to form self-government at local and national levels to address educational and cultural issues.³¹

²⁵ Ministry of Social Administration and Justice, *National Social Inclusion Strategy. Extreme poverty, child poverty and Roma*, 2011. http://ec.europa.eu/justice/discrimination/files/roma_hungary_strategy_en.pdf.

²⁶ <http://www.minorityrights.org/?lid=5800>. Accessed on July 25, 2013.

²⁷ Ministry of Social Administration and Justice, *National Social Inclusion Strategy. Extreme poverty, child poverty and Roma*, 2011. http://ec.europa.eu/justice/discrimination/files/roma_hungary_strategy_en.pdf.

²⁸ *Idem*.

²⁹ Horvath and Kiss v. Hungary case <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/pages/search.aspx?i=001-116124#%7B%22fulltext%22:%5B%22horvath%20and%20kiss%22%5D,%22itemid%22:%5B%22001-109467%22%5D%7D>. Accessed on November 14, 2013.

³⁰ *Freedom in the world. Hungary*, <http://www.freedomhouse.org/report/freedom-world/2012/hungary>. Accessed on July 27, 2013.

³¹ See the law on the Rights of National and Ethnic Minorities <http://www.refworld.org/docid/4c3476272.html>. Accessed on November 14, 2013.

5. Findings

5.1. Inter-group relations, including record of discrimination and/or other human rights violations committed against a group

1. Human rights NGOs have consistently reported that the Roma in Hungary are discriminated against in almost all fields of life, particularly in education, health care, housing, employment, and access to public places and public life.³² According to data from the Hungarian Government, 70% to 80% of Roma live below the poverty line.³³ Poverty is a major factor that affects educational outcomes for Romani children. As a result of geographical isolation in poor rural communities and settlements, many Roma families live far from good schools and cannot afford public transportation, books, or other educational expenses.³⁴ Poverty, limited education, and “isolation in ghetto-type settlements” are also linked to factors that perpetuate segregation and discrimination and contribute to unequal access to health care and other services.
2. A 2012 poll conducted by the Anti-Defamation League in 10 European countries showed that Hungary has among the highest level of bias against the Jews in Europe. A reported 73% of Hungarians believe that “Jews have too much power in the business world.”³⁵
3. Anti-immigrant and welfare prejudice is prevalent across Central and Eastern Europe. However, compared to other Central and Eastern Europe countries, Hungary is the most anti-immigrant and most hostile towards ethnically different immigrants. Studies have found that 52% of people in Hungary reject newcomers; nearly one-third of adults older than 15 years old said they would not allow non-Hungarian migrants to settle at all.³⁶ When asked about the Roma in particular, 60% of the population in Hungary believed that criminality was in the “gypsy” blood, and 82% declared that the Roma population’s problems would end “when they started working.”³⁷ An additional 42% of Hungarians thought it would be right for clubs or pubs to forbid Roma access, and two-

³² ERRC, *Written comments by the European Roma Rights Center concerning Hungary for consideration by the Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe*, U.S. Helsinki Commission, 2013. <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/hungary-us-helsinki-commission-19-march-2013.pdf>.

³³ Ministry of Social Administration and Justice, *National Social Inclusion Strategy. Extreme poverty, child poverty and Roma*, 2011. http://ec.europa.eu/justice/discrimination/files/roma_hungary_strategy_en.pdf.

³⁴ Roma Education Fund, *Roma Inclusion in Education*, 2010. http://www.ose.be/files/midi_OSE/RomaInclusionEducation_PositionPaperREF.pdf.

³⁵ Anti-Defamation League, *Attitudes Toward Jews In Ten European Countries*, 2012. http://archive.adl.org/Anti_semitism/adl_anti-semitism_presentation_february_2012.pdf.

³⁶ *Anti-Immigrant Prejudice in Central and Eastern Europe*, September 16, 2010. http://www.riskandforecast.com/post/bulgaria/anti-immigrant-prejudice-in-central-and-eastern-europe_581.html. Accessed on July 26, 2013.

ENAR, *Shadow Report 2009-2010: Racism and Discrimination in Hungary*. <http://cms.horus.be/files/99935/MediaArchive/Hungary.pdf>.

³⁷ TARKI Social Research Institute and Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, *The roots of radicalism and anti-Roma attitudes on the far right*. 2012. http://www.tarki.hu/hu/news/2012/kitekint/20121122_bernart_kreko_prezentacio.pdf.

thirds of Hungarians said they would not allow their children to become friends with a Roma child.³⁸

4. Ethnic profiling by the police is common in Hungary. According to a study by the Hungarian Helsinki Committee on ID checks carried out in 2007 and 2008, Roma were three times more likely to be stopped by the police for ID checks than non-Roma.³⁹ Police brutality against Roma in Hungary is also a concern. According to the Office of the Chief Public Prosecutor, there were 15 complaints of police mistreatment and 10 complaints of use of force during interrogation in 2008, resulting in 18 indictments. “**Country Reports 2008**” said that “many victims remained fearful of seeking legal remedies or of notifying NGOs” and cited NGOs who stated that most complaints were made by Roma.⁴⁰ Roma participation in public and political life in Hungary is modest.
5. Of the 386 members of the Hungarian Parliament, only four are Roma. The Hungarian government has established programs to increase the presence of Roma in the government, including support for the National Roma Self-Government and political organization of Roma through various associations. Established in 1993, the Minority Self-Government (MSG) system enables ethnic minority groups in Hungary to elect their own bodies at local, regional and national levels and manage mainly cultural issues such as Romani language, media and education⁴¹. According to NDI, “the local and national MSGs fall far short of the range of competencies that the title “self-government” implies. They lack the authority to take action outside of a very limited scope of issues and function more like NGOs than elected governing bodies.”⁴² The National Roma Self-Government is also led by a member of the ruling Fidesz party.

Education

6. Despite governmental policies that seek to reduce ethnic and socio-economic barriers, Roma continue to fare worse than their non-Roma peers, particularly in education. Romani children’s school enrollment is hindered by several factors, including: a dearth of seats in the classroom, unreceptive school management, lack of public transportation, and segregated schools and

³⁸ International “radicalism index” puts Hungary fifth of 33 countries; belief in genetic roots of Roma crime widespread, December 5, 2011.

<http://www.politics.hu/2011/12/05/international-radicalism-index-puts-hungary-fifth-of-33-countries-belief-in-genetic-roots-of-roma-crime-widespread/>. Accessed on July 27, 2013.

³⁹ Amnesty International. *Violent attacks against Roma in Hungary - Time to investigate racial motivation*, 2012. http://www.amnesty.at/uploads/tx_amnesty/Violent_attacks_against_Roma_in_Hungary_report_web_02.pdf.

⁴⁰ Immigration and Refugee Board of Canada, *Hungary: Treatment of Roma; state protection efforts (2006 - Sept. 2009)*, 2009. <http://www.refworld.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/rwmain?page=country&category=&publisher=&type=&coi=HUN&rid=4562d8b62&docid=4b20f043c&skip=0>.

⁴¹ NDI, OSCE/ODIHR, *The Hungarian Minority Self-Government System as a means of increasing Romani political participation*, 2006.

⁴² Idem.

classes.⁴³ In general, Roma in Hungary start school at a later age and are more likely to drop out than their non-Roma peers.⁴⁴

7. Although segregation is officially illegal in Hungary, Romani children are frequently placed into segregated schools and classes, in particular schools and classes for children with intellectual disabilities. A 2006 report on Hungary by the Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights found that 20% of Romani children had been assigned to special schools as opposed to 2% of ethnically Hungarian children.⁴⁵ According to the ECHR, despite measures taken in recent years, “the rate of mentally disabled children has been continuously increasing in Hungary, especially in the ‘mild mental disability’ and ‘other disability’ categories. Children with disadvantaged backgrounds, especially Roma ones, are significantly over-represented amongst children with a disability.”⁴⁶ In addition, intellectual ability assessments are often conducted under inappropriate conditions, ignoring language or cultural issues.⁴⁷ The ECHR ruled against Hungary in 2013 in the case of *Horváth and Kiss v. Hungary*, deciding that the two complainants were misdiagnosed and wrongly educated in a school for pupils with mental disabilities.⁴⁸
8. In some cases, Romani children are separated from their peers in mixed education settings and placed into segregated classes; these Roma classes then follow a remedial curriculum. In other cases, Romani children are placed into short-term vocational schools, which according to Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE), is a form of de facto segregation. Short-term vocational education is “the last resort for socially and academically excluded young people, many of whom are Roma. The system is disconnected from employers’ needs, with few apprenticeship opportunities and high drop-out rates, i.e. around 20-25 percent in grades nine and 10.”⁴⁹ Despite negative outcomes, few Roma parents oppose those measures, as they lack information and financial resources, or have no tools to fight against discrimination. Another factor that leads to segregation is the tendency of non-Roma parents to withdraw their children from schools with a high proportion of Roma.⁵⁰ While spontaneous migration of non-Roma results

⁴³ Roma Education Fund, *Roma Inclusion in Education*, 2010.

http://www.ose.be/files/midi_OSE/RomaInclusionEducation_PositionPaperREF.pdf.

⁴⁴ OSI, *Equal access to quality education for Roma*, 2007.

http://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/sites/default/files/1summary_20070329_0.pdf.

⁴⁵ Council of Europe, *Follow-up report on Hungary (2002-2005). Assessment of the progress made in implementing the recommendations of the Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights*, 2006.

<https://wcd.coe.int/ViewDoc.jsp?id=984085&Site=CommDH&BackColorInternet=FEC65B&BackColorIntranet=FEC65B&BackColorLogged=FFC679>.

⁴⁶ *Horváth and Kiss v. Hungary* case <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/pages/search.aspx?i=001-116124#%7B%22fulltext%22%3A%22horvath%20and%20kiss%22%2C%22itemid%22%3A%22001-109467%22%7D>. Accessed on August 14, 2013.

⁴⁷ OSI, *Equal Access to Quality Education for Roma*, 2007.

http://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/sites/default/files/1summary_20070329_0.pdf.

⁴⁸ *Horváth and Kiss v. Hungary* case, <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/pages/search.aspx?i=001-116124#%7B%22fulltext%22%3A%22horvath%20and%20kiss%22%2C%22itemid%22%3A%22001-109467%22%7D>. Accessed on August 14, 2013.

⁴⁹ Roma Education Fund, *Roma Inclusion in Education*, 2010.

http://www.ose.be/files/midi_OSE/RomaInclusionEducation_PositionPaperREF.pdf.

⁵⁰ OSI, *Equal Access to Quality Education for Roma*, 2007.

http://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/sites/default/files/1summary_20070329_0.pdf.

in *de facto* segregation among schools, school officials who favor separate Roma schools are also at fault for perpetuating segregation.⁵¹

9. In its fourth monitoring report, ECRI in 2009 recommended that Hungary “introduce an independent monitoring system at the national level to ensure the compliance with centrally enacted legislation of measures taken by school maintainers; it considers that this system should in particular be instrumental in ensuring that the prohibition on segregation is respected in practice, and requests priority implementation for this recommendation in the next two years.”⁵²

Health

10. According to the Council of Europe’s Advisory Committee on the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities, Roma “suffer from indirect discrimination which deprives them of equal access to health services.” The FRA 2012 Household Survey found that more Roma than non-Roma reported having difficulties conducting daily activities due to health problems. The life expectancy for Roma is generally 10 years shorter and the child mortality rate higher than that of the majority Hungarian population.⁵³
11. As a result of direct discrimination and degrading treatment by doctors and other hospital staff, lack of access to and awareness of medical services, and their disadvantaged position within the family structure, Romani women face significantly worse health outcomes than that of the general population. For example, Hungarian Romani women are three times more likely to die from cancer than non-Roma Hungarian women.⁵⁴
12. Romani women have been the targets of coercive sterilization in Hungary.⁵⁵ In the case of *A.S. v. Hungary*, the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women found more than one violation of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women in regard to the coercive sterilization of a Hungarian woman of Roma ethnic origin (*A.S.*).⁵⁶ While on the operating table for an emergency cesarean section and suffering from heavy bleeding, *A.S.* was asked to sign a “barely legible note written partially in Latin” that authorized her sterilization procedure. After the procedure, *A.S.* wanted to know when she could become pregnant again.⁵⁷

⁵¹ Roma Education Fund, *Roma Inclusion in Education*, 2010.

http://www.ose.be/files/midi_OSE/RomaInclusionEducation_PositionPaperREF.pdf.

⁵² ECRI, *ECRI report on Hungary. Forth monitoring cycle*, 2009. <http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/country-by-country/hungary/HUN-CbC-IV-2009-003-ENG.pdf>.

⁵³ Roma Education Fund, *Advancing education of Roma in Hungary*, 2007. http://academos.ro/sites/default/files/biblio-docs/1036/hungary_report.pdf

⁵⁴ OSF Report – June 9 2011.

⁵⁵ ERRC, *Written comments by the European Roma Rights Center concerning Hungary for consideration by the European Commission on the transposition and application of the Race Directive and on the legal issues relevant to Roma integration*, 2013. <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/hungary-red-written-comments-5-april-2013.pdf>.

⁵⁶ UN Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women, *CEDAW/C/36/D/4/2004*, August 29, 2006. http://www2.ohchr.org/english/law/docs/Case4_2004.pdf.

⁵⁷ Open Society Foundations, *Against Her Will: Forced and Coerced Sterilization of Women Worldwide* <http://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/sites/default/files/against-her-will-20111003.pdf>.

Housing

13. Romani households are usually located in segregated environments with inferior housing. A 2009 study commissioned by the FRA found: “The most problematic feature of the Romani housing is segregation, the most widespread forms of which are colonies, micro-regions subject to ‘ghettoization’ and urban slum areas. [...] [A]vailable sources estimate the proportion of Roma living in segregated environment to 45-55 percent.”⁵⁸ In Hungary, housing inequalities are strongly linked to spatial disparities. According to a 2010 survey by the Ministry of National Resources, approximately 100,000 seriously disadvantaged persons, mainly Roma, lived in approximately 500 settlements that lacked basic infrastructure and were often located on the outskirts of cities.⁵⁹
14. According to the FRA 2012 Household Survey, over 40% of Roma surveyed, as compared to less than 20% of non-Roma surveyed, lack at least one of the following four basic amenities: indoor kitchen, indoor toilet, indoor shower or bath, and electricity. The Roma surveyed also live in denser environments with over two Roma persons per room on average compared to less than one and a half non-Roma persons per room on average.⁶⁰
15. Roma face racial discrimination in allotment of social housing. According to the FRA, a fifth of Roma in Hungary had experienced discrimination when looking for housing.⁶¹

Employment

16. Overall unemployment in Hungary remains high at more than 11%.⁶² According to the US Department of State, approximately 85% of working-age Hungarian Roma were unemployed in 2011.⁶³ In underdeveloped regions of Hungary, approximately 90% of all working-age Roma are unemployed⁶⁴ and the employment rate among Roma women remains a meager 10%.⁶⁵ NGO representatives attest that the high rate of Roma unemployment is a result of frequent

⁵⁸ FRA, *Housing conditions of Roma and Travellers*, 2009. http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/583-RAXEN-Roma%20Housing-Hungary_en.pdf.

⁵⁹ 2011 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices – Hungary, May 24, 2012. <http://www.refworld.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/rwmain?page=country&category=&publisher=USDOS&type=&coi=HUN&rid=&docid=4fc75a954c&skip=0>. Accessed on July 11, 2013.

⁶⁰ FRA 2012 Study.

⁶¹ FRA, *Housing discrimination against Roma in selected EU Member States: An analysis of EU-MIDIS data*, 2009. http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/607-Roma-Housing-Analysis-EU-MIDIS_en.pdf.

⁶² <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/hu.html>. Accessed on July 11, 2013.

⁶³ 2011 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices – Hungary, May 24, 2012.

<http://www.refworld.org/docid/4fc75a954c.html>. Accessed on July 12, 2013.

⁶⁴ Hungary: *Situation of Roma, including employment, housing, health care, and political participation; whether Roma are required to pay a fee for health services (2010-June 2012)*, July 13, 2012.

<http://www.refworld.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/rwmain?page=country&category=&publisher=IRBC&type=&coi=HUN&rid=&docid=5036010888&skip=0>. Accessed on July 12, 2013.

⁶⁵ Ministry of Social Administration and Justice, *National Social Inclusion Strategy. Extreme poverty, child poverty and Roma*, 2011. http://ec.europa.eu/justice/discrimination/files/roma_hungary_strategy_en.pdf.

discrimination against Roma in the labor market.⁶⁶ In a 2012 Household Survey by the FRA, over 40% of Roma respondents aged 16 and above said that they had experienced discrimination while looking for work in the past five years because of their Roma background.⁶⁷

17. In many cases, Roma have described situations where they have been informed via telephone that a vacancy was still available, only to be immediately rejected upon arrival at the prospective employer.⁶⁸ The labor offices in some areas of Hungary, such as the city of Eger, have a filtering mechanism to ensure that Roma are not sent to companies that do not hire Roma. The labor office is thereby complicit in the discrimination process. The ERRC confirmed this procedure with two independent sources.⁶⁹

5.2. History of genocide or related serious and massive human rights violations against a particular group

The Holocaust

18. Along with 550,000 Hungarian Jews who were killed during the Holocaust, thousands of Hungarian Roma were sent to concentration camps in Hungary and Germany and later killed⁷⁰ in 1944 and 1945.⁷¹
19. A Roma Holocaust Memorial was built in 2006 in Budapest.⁷²
20. Three Holocaust monuments in Budapest (the Holocaust Memorial and Documentation Center, the statue of Raoul Wallenberg, and the bronze shoes honoring the 10,000 Jews shot on the banks of the Danube River) were vandalized in 2012.⁷³ A Holocaust memorial that inscribed the names of locals deported to concentration camps in 1944 was vandalized in 2010 in the city of Zalaegerszeg as well.⁷⁴
21. The leaders of extreme groups in Hungary continue to praise Holocaust leaders. In 2010, when asked during an interview what he thought of Adolf Hitler, Zsolt Tyirityán, the leader of the

⁶⁶ UN, *Report of the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance: Mission to Hungary*, 2012. http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Racism/A.HRC.20.33.Add.1_en.pdf.

⁶⁷ FRA study (pg. 19).

⁶⁸ ERRC, *The Glass Box: Exclusion of Roma from Employment*, 2007. <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/media/02/14/m00000214.pdf>.

⁶⁹ Idem.

⁷⁰ *Factsheet on Roma. Concentration camps*, <http://romafacts.uni-graz.at/index.php/history/persecution-internment-genocide-holocaust/concentration-camps>. Accessed on August 6, 2013.

⁷¹ *Resources for educators*, <http://www.ushmm.org/education/resource/roma/RomaSBklt.pdf>. Accessed on August 6, 2013.

⁷² *Roma Holocaust Memorial*, <http://www.memorialmuseums.org/eng/staettens/view/1420/Roma-Holocaust-Memorial>. Accessed on August 6, 2013.

⁷³ *The testimony of Paul A. Shapiro*, U.S. Holocaust Memorial Museum, March 20, 2013.

<http://hungarianspectrum.wordpress.com/2013/03/20/the-testimony-of-paul-a-shapiro-u-s-holocaust-memorial-museum/>. Accessed on August 7, 2013.

⁷⁴ *Holocaust memorial vandalized in W Hungary*, May 3, 2010

. <http://www.politics.hu/20100503/holocaust-memorial-vandalized-in-w-hungary/>. Accessed on August 7, 2013.

Outlaws Army organization, said, “He was an influential European politician who hasn't got the rightful acknowledgement, yet.”⁷⁵ In April 2012, Pax Hungarica, an extreme Hungarian group, made statement commemorating Adolf Hitler on his birthday.⁷⁶

Patterns of impunity and lack of accountability for past crimes committed against targeted groups

22. CBS News reported in 2011 that the Hungarian Parliament approved a “socially and fiscally conservative” constitution and its preamble “includes an attempt to whitewash Hungary’s role in the Holocaust.”⁷⁷
23. The national Holocaust curriculum, including teacher training, from primary school to university does not promote tolerance towards the racial, religious, and other minorities in Hungary. The lack of tolerance education is “widely blamed for the current resurgence of neo-Nazi power.”⁷⁸
24. Lydia Gall, the Eastern Europe and the Balkans researcher at Human Rights Watch, wrote in a January 2013 special report to CNN: “With violence and discrimination against Roma a pervasive and longstanding problem, and anti-Semitic attacks on people and memorials increasing, there is an urgent need for the Hungarian government and prime minister to address these alarming trends and for Hungary’s international partners to impress upon its leaders that the situation is not acceptable.”⁷⁹

5.3. Circumstances that hamper the capacity to prevent genocide

Existing structures, effectiveness, risks

25. In April 2011, Hungary adopted a new Constitution that went into effect in January 2012.⁸⁰ The constitutional changes were met by widespread mass protests and critiques from the international community.⁸¹ The Venice Commission of the Council of Europe voiced its concerns in 2011: “[T]he constitution-making process, including the drafting and the final adoption of the new Constitution, has been affected by lack of transparency, shortcomings in the dialogue between the majority and the opposition, the insufficient opportunities for an adequate public debate, and a

⁷⁵ Hate groups maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/33>. Accessed on August 7, 2013.

⁷⁶ *Idem*.

⁷⁷ *Rights groups blast Hungary's new constitution*, April 18, 2011.

<http://www.cbc.ca/news/world/story/2011/04/18/world-hungary-constitution.html>. Accessed on August 7, 2013.

⁷⁸ *New Hungarian Constitution Shirks Responsibility for the Holocaust*, September 2011.

http://www.newenglishreview.org/custpage.cfm/fm/96102/sec_id/96102. Accessed on August 8, 2013.

⁷⁹ *Hungary's alarming climate of intolerance*, January 18, 2013.

<http://globalpublicsquare.blogs.cnn.com/2013/01/18/hungarys-alarming-climate-of-intolerance/>. Accessed on August 8, 2013.

⁸⁰ *The fundamental law of Hungary*, 2011.

<http://www.kormany.hu/download/4/c3/30000/THE%20FUNDAMENTAL%20LAW%20OF%20HUNGARY.pdf>

⁸¹ *Constitutional Reforms: Hungary Steps Away from European Democracy*, March 11, 2013.

<http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/hungary-constitutional-reforms-signal-drift-away-from-democracy-a-888064.html>. Accessed on August 8, 2013.

very tight timeframe.”⁸² Human Rights Watch said that “the changes have undermined media freedom, limited judicial independence, and weakened the power of the constitutional court, which has been a key check on the executive.”⁸³

26. On January 1, 2012, the Ombudsmen system was restructured. The Parliamentary Commissioner for the National and Ethnic Minority Rights had previously held a wide mandate.⁸⁴ After the changes are implemented, the legal team assisting the Commissioner will cease to exist and the commissioner will work with a highly reduced apparatus as a deputy to the Commissioner on Fundamental Rights.
27. In 2013, Prime Minister Viktor Orbán, a member of the conservative Fidesz party, approved a set of highly controversial amendments to the country’s constitution that weaken Hungary’s constitutional court and limit the independence of the judiciary branch in general. According to Hungarian opposition parties, EU policymakers, and legal scholars, these amendments indicate a departure from the principles of liberal democracy and civil rights and might have a “negative impact on the rule of law and respect for fundamental rights.”⁸⁵
28. The amendments place limits on free speech.⁸⁶ The amendments also include a law to limit the emigration of highly-educated workers by requiring students to either work in Hungary for a certain amount of time after finishing their university degree or pay tuition fees. In a country where state-funded higher education has long served as the guarantor that pupils from lower social classes and disadvantaged groups can enjoy *de facto* access to universities, introducing tuition fees is a particularly drastic step.⁸⁷ In addition, the reforms also contain laws that had previously been overturned and deemed unconstitutional by the Constitutional Court in Hungary. These changes include a constitutional amendment that fines the country’s homeless up to \$650 USD or a jail sentence of 60 days for repeatedly sleeping outside. The law came into force as of October 15, 2013 and during the first two weeks of its operation, already 66 legal proceedings were initiated against homeless persons for the offence of “habitual residence in public space.”⁸⁸ Two independent human rights specialists from the UN stated that “by a wave of the legislative pen, the

⁸² Venice Commission-Council of Europe, *Opinion on the new Constitution of Hungary adopted by the Venice Commission at its 87th Plenary Session*, 2011. [http://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/CDL-AD\(2011\)016-E.aspx](http://www.venice.coe.int/webforms/documents/CDL-AD(2011)016-E.aspx).

⁸³ **Hungary: Constitution Changes Warrant EU Action, March 12, 2013.**

<http://www.hrw.org/news/2013/03/12/hungary-constitution-changes-warrant-eu-action>. Accessed on August 12, 2013.

⁸⁴ *On the activities of the Parliamentary Commissioner for National and Ethnic Rights*,

<http://www.kisebbsegombudsman.hu/hir-189-the-parliamentary-commissioner-for.html>. Accessed on August 12, 2013.

⁸⁵ *Schulz regrets hasty adoption of constitutional changes in Hungary*, March 11, 2013.

<http://www.pes.eu/en/news/schulz-regrets-hasty-adoption-constitutional-changes-hungary>. Accessed on August 10, 2013.

⁸⁶ *Constitutional Reforms: Hungary Steps Away from European Democracy*, March 11, 2013.

<http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/hungary-constitutional-reforms-signal-drift-away-from-democracy-a-888064.html>. Accessed on August 10, 2013.

⁸⁷ [unofficial translation] “The law can make financial support for the participation in higher education dependent on participation in employment or business activity for a specified period of time as governed by law.” Section XI (3) of the Basic Law of the Republic of Hungary

http://net.jogtar.hu/jr/gen/hjegy_doc.cgi?docid=A1100425.ATV accessed on January 28, 2014

⁸⁸ http://avarosmindenkie.blog.hu/tags/%C3%A9letvitelszer%C5%B1_lakhat%C3%A1s_k%C3%B6zter%C3%BCleten accessed on December 3, 2013

Hungarian Parliament has labeled tens of thousands of homeless people in Hungary as potential criminals. Moreover, the law has a discriminatory impact on those living in poverty.”⁸⁹

Summary

29. The rights of paramilitary militias, who flaunt deeply anti-Roma sentiments, have also been strengthened, and the right to use arms for self-protection of one’s own property has been introduced.⁹⁰
30. The changes to the Constitution enshrine a growing trend towards more right-wing extremist policies.⁹¹ Over the past year, violent attacks against Roma have declined, only to be replaced by right wing policies and legislation. In other countries such as Kosovo, Bosnia and Herzegovina, similar trends have been recorded: outright violence has been supplanted by anti-minority policies and legislation.

5.4. Motivation of leading actors in the State; acts which serve to encourage divisions between national, racial, ethnic, and religious groups

Creation of paramilitary, militia, vigilant groups, and extreme right organizations

31. The paramilitary, neo-Nazi, and far-right extremist groups and organizations hold concrete anti-Roma goals in Hungary. They organize anti-Roma marches, openly engage in hate speech and violence against Roma, and carry out hate-motivated killings.
32. Concentrated in Budapest, the Hungarian Guard⁹² was founded in May 2007 by well-known politicians and opinion makers to the extreme right, including Csanád Szegedi and Gabor Vona, the current Jobbik Party president. Jobbik registered the Hungarian Guard as a “cultural organization” to “prepare youth spiritually and physically for extraordinary situations when it might be necessary to mobilize the people.”⁹³ The organization espouses an extreme racist ideology with the explicit aim of stopping “Gypsy Crime” in Hungary. According to Csanád Szegedi, “gypsy crime [...] is a serious form of crime which poses a danger to everybody.”⁹⁴ Under the leadership of József Ináncsi at the height of its popularity, the Hungarian Guard had approximately 700 members.⁹⁵

⁸⁹ *UN experts speak out against Hungarian law criminalizing homelessness*, February 15, 2012.

<http://www.un.org/apps/news/story.asp?NewsID=41246#.UYFsOb8TFSU>. Accessed on August 12, 2013.

⁹⁰ *Blurring Boundaries: Hungarian Leader Adopts Policies of Far-Right*, January 30, 2013.

<http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/ruling-hungarian-fidesz-party-adopts-policies-of-far-right-jobbik-party-a-880590.html>. Accessed on August 19, 2013.

⁹¹ *Idem*.

⁹² Magyar Gárda

⁹³ *Public support for Magyar Gárda grows*, May 18, 2009.

<http://www.politics.hu/20090518/public-support-for-magyar-garda-grows/>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

⁹⁴ Hate groups maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/30#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

⁹⁵ Identified domestic extremist groups, http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/hate_groups/. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

33. In July 2007, the Hungarian Guard founded the Hungarian Guard Movement with the objective of “defending Hungary, [who is] defenseless physically, spiritually and intellectually.”⁹⁶ They organized anti-Roma rallies and marches in different villages and cities wearing special military uniforms to identify and unify the group members.⁹⁷ The Hungarian Guard Movement was the most radical and well-organized nationalistic paramilitary organization out of the right-wing extremist groups that has emerged in Hungary.
34. In December 2008, a Hungarian Court dissolved the Hungarian Guard and the Hungarian Guard Movement, claiming that the public perception that “here comes the Guard and it will restore order” was not acceptable according to the constitution, and that moreover, the group’s use of fear to intimidate others was not acceptable.⁹⁸ The Supreme Court expressed in its verdict that “the ethnicity- and race-based opinions expressed at the demonstrations and events organized by the Hungarian Guard against ‘gypsy crime’ have in fact breached the basic principle of the right to human dignity. The Hungarian Guard has [...] turned discrimination into an agenda. In order to express this, the Hungarian Guard has held intimidating demonstrations on several occasions.”⁹⁹ In response to the ban on the Hungarian Guard, Gabor Vona stated that the participants would continue with their activities.¹⁰⁰
35. Following the Supreme Court decision, Gabor Vona came before the ECHR to argue that the dissolution of the association violated Article 11 of the European Convention on freedom of assembly and freedom of association.¹⁰¹ In July 2013, the ECHR ruled that the activities of the association intimidated the Roma population and that “[t]he State is entitled to take preventive measures to protect democracy [...] if a sufficiently imminent prejudice to the rights of others undermines the fundamental values upon which a democratic society rests and functions. One of such values is the cohabitation of members of society without racial segregation, without which a democratic society is inconceivable.”¹⁰² The ECHR declared that “the use of the expression ‘Gypsy crime,’ which suggests that there is a link between crime and a certain ethnicity, constitutes a racist form of speech intended to fuel feelings of hatred against the targeted ethnic group. This expression reflects a clearly divided view of society into ‘them,’ the Roma, perpetrators of crimes, and ‘us,’ the ‘ethnic’ Hungarians, the victims of their crimes. Such sweeping generalizations attributing negative behavior and characteristics are made solely on the basis of the target group’s origin and ethnicity. Intolerance and prejudice towards Roma are

⁹⁶ Case of Vona v. Hungary, <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/pages/search.aspx?i=001-122183#%7B%22fulltext%22:%5B%22magyar%20garda%22%5D%2C%22itemid%22:%5B%22001-122183%22%5D%7D>. Accessed on September 5, 2013.

⁹⁷ Hate groups maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/30#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

⁹⁸ Court dissolves Hungarian Guard, claiming right-wing group insults Roma minority, December 17, 2008.

<http://www.politics.hu/20081217/court-dissolves-hungarian-guard-claiming-rightwing-group-insults-roma-minority/>.

⁹⁹ Hate groups maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/30>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹⁰⁰ Hungarian Guard turns to Supreme Court over ban, September 21, 2009.

<http://www.politics.hu/20090921/hungarian-guard-turns-to-supreme-court-over-ban/>. Accessed on September 11, 2013.

¹⁰¹ Council of Europe, *European Convention on Human Rights*, http://www.echr.coe.int/Documents/Convention_ENG.pdf.

¹⁰² ERRC Welcomes ECtHR Ruling Upholding Ban on Far-Right Group in Hungary, July 9, 2013.

<http://www.errc.org/article/errc-welcomes-ecthr-ruling-upholding-ban-on-far-right-group-in-hungary/4159>. Accessed on September 11, 2013.

objectively fanned by statements of this nature. The same can be said for the anti-Semitic utterances made in the parades.”¹⁰³

36. Following the ban of the Hungarian Guard, the New Hungarian Guard (UJ Magyar Garda) was quickly established. Founded in 2009 and based in Budapest, the New Hungarian Guard succeeded the Hungarian Guard by adopting policies of extreme racism and continuing to carry out its mission of eradicating “Gypsy crime” and conducting civil patrols by its gendarmerie. However, the reach of the New Hungarian Guard is much smaller.¹⁰⁴ Its exact size and leadership are not publicly known, but the group is believed to have about 200 members.¹⁰⁵ The New Hungarian Guard, and other local vigilante organizations and paramilitary groups that formed around the same time¹⁰⁶ systematically create a threatening atmosphere in Roma communities through anti-Roma rallies, violent attacks against community members, and hate crimes via electronic means.¹⁰⁷ The Jobbik Party under Gabor Vona supports these groups and employs the same anti-Roma narrative.¹⁰⁸
37. The Outlaws Army (Betyársereg) is another racist extremist organization in Hungary that was formed in 2008 and espouses a supremacist ideology. The Outlaws Army believes in using brutal force and violence to achieve its goals, and its leaders idealize the illegal nature of their actions. Their violent vision is often manifested in actions aimed at intimidating Roma. The Athena Institute estimates that there are 60 members in the group; its operations are centralized in the Southern Great Plains region (Szeged). Members of the Socialist Party claim that this group is openly “the strategic partner of a parliamentary party, the extreme-right Jobbik.”¹⁰⁹ In 2011, the Hungarian Helsinki Committee asked the Prosecutor’s Office to investigate the Outlaws Army,¹¹⁰ whose leader urged the audience at a public event to kill Jews, Roma, and people of color. The Hungarian Helsinki Committee asked the Prime Minister and the President to condemn such manifestations of hatred.¹¹¹
38. The Association For a Better Future Civil Guard (NPFHCGA) is a militant organization involved in anti-Roma activities in areas outside of Budapest, including the town of Gyongyospata (see paragraph no 58-63). Formed in 2010, the NPFHCGA was founded to “protect the Hungarians”

¹⁰³ Case of Vona v. Hungary, <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/pages/search.aspx?i=001-122183#%7B%22fulltext%22:%5B%22magyar%20garda%22%5D%2C%22itemid%22:%5B%22001-122183%22%5D%7D>. Accessed on September 5, 2013.

¹⁰⁴ <http://ujmagyargarda.com>.

¹⁰⁵ Hate groups maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/30#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹⁰⁶ Identified domestic extremist groups, http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/hate_groups/. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹⁰⁷ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, 2012.

<http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

¹⁰⁸ *Hungary’s Rising Hyper-Nationalist Jobbik Party and the Legacy of Anti-Semitism and Anti-Gypsyism*, June 25, 2012. <http://geocurrents.info/place/europe/hungarys-rising-hyper-nationalist-jobbik-party-and-the-legacy-of-anti-semitism-and-anti-gypsyism>. Accessed on September 7, 2013.

¹⁰⁹ *Socialists urge national security committee meeting over racist speech at festival*, August 17, 2011.

<http://www.politics.hu/20110817/socialists-urge-national-security-cttee-meeting-over-racist-speech-at-festival/>. Accessed on September 11, 2013.

¹¹⁰ A collaborator of the parliamentary party Jobbik.

¹¹¹ Hungarian Helsinki Committee News, <http://helsinki.hu/en/%E2%80%9Cthe-silent-man-is-an-accomplice%E2%80%A6%E2%80%9D-the-hungarian-helsinki-committee-turns-to-the-prosecutor-to-investigate-and-to-the-concerned-politicians-to-condemn-hate-speech>. Accessed on September 11, 2013.

from “Gypsy criminality” and “Gypsy terror.” Its ideology is based on racist extremism and anti-Semitism.¹¹² This group operates in the Nyírség region and has an estimated 150 members.¹¹³ Due to its philosophy and the nature of its demonstrations, the ERRC has linked the NPFHCGA to both the Hungarian National Guard and, increasingly, the Jobbik Party and the New Hungarian Guard.¹¹⁴

39. Pax Hungarica is the successor organization of the Blood and Honor Cultural Association, which was disbanded by a Hungarian Court in 2005 due to its highly offensive language against Roma, Jewish, or LGBT people at the organization’s events. According to the 1947 Paris Peace Treaty, Hungary is obligated to disband all political and military organizations of a fascist nature. The Court rejected Pax Hungarica’s application for registration due to its openly discriminatory references to the Hungarian LGBT community. Since 2008, the group has operated through an informal organizational structure. Although no violent actions can be attributed to the organization, it can be linked to hostile propaganda campaigns against the Hungarian Roma, Jewish, and LGBT communities. At public events, Pax Hungarica members usually wear uniforms and armbands, which resemble those worn by members of the Arrow Cross Party, a Hungarian supremacist organization from the 1940s.¹¹⁵
40. The Hungarian National Front has been one of the largest and most organized paramilitary hate groups in Hungary since 1989. They have an anti-Roma, anti-Jewish, and anti-foreigner political agenda and their “action groups” have been trained for actual armed combat.¹¹⁶
41. The website Kuruc.info was formed in 2005 and propagates Hungarian supremacist ideology, racist extremism and anti-Semitism that targets Roma, Jews, homosexuals, and other minority groups. Kuruc.info fosters hate speech through their published articles and reader commentary, and has included articles on alleged “Gypsy crime” and “Jewish crime.” The site is presumed to have three editors and 10 to 15 authors, and is estimated to attract about 50,000 readers per day. Although the site is for a Hungarian audience, the website domain is hosted in the U.S. Since 2008, there have been multiple attempts by the Hungarian government to get the U.S. to take action against this site – all of which have failed.¹¹⁷

Summary

42. Barbara Harff, expert on genocide prevention, shows that in pre-genocidal situations “we see the emergence of vigilante groups, increased police brutality, increased military involvement in civil affairs, increased human rights violations and ideological encroachment on judicial decisions.”¹¹⁸

¹¹² Hate groups maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/30#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹¹³ Identified domestic extremist groups, http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/hate_groups/. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹¹⁴ NGOs letter to the Hungarian institutions urging for reactions on the patrols organized by paramilitary group, April 14, 2011. <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/hungary-hajduhadhaz-letter-english-14-april-2011.pdf>. Accessed on September 5, 2013.

¹¹⁵ Hate groups maps <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/32>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹¹⁶ Hate groups maps <http://athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/20>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹¹⁷ Police say anti-Semitic Hungarian website hosted in US beyond authorities’ reach, September 6, 2012. <http://www.politics.hu/20120906/police-say-anti-semitic-hungarian-website-hosted-in-us-beyond-authorities-reach/>. Accessed on September 17, 2013.

¹¹⁸ Barbara Harff, *Countries at risk of genocide and politicide in 2012*, in Guiding principles of the emerging architecture aiming at the prevention of genocide, war crime, and crimes against humanity, Genocide prevention advisory net, 2012.

In Hungary, the extremist groups and organizations have conducted targeted anti-Roma events, indicating a trajectory towards the perpetration of violence against Roma.

The use of exclusionary ideology and the construction of identities in terms of “us” and “them” to accentuate differences

43. The (FRA) conducted a survey on discrimination that showed that Roma, Sub-Saharan Africans and North Africans are the most discriminated against groups in the European Union. Half of Roma surveyed were discriminated against due to their ethnic origins, more than any other minority or marginalized group. While there were levels of discrimination in all Member States, the Czech Republic and Hungary had the highest rates of discrimination against Roma, 64% and 62%, respectively.¹¹⁹
44. On January 5, 2013, Zsolt Bayer, founding member of Hungary’s governing Fidesz party and Hungarian journalist, wrote a column in the Magyar Hírlap newspaper stating that “a significant part of the Roma are unfit for coexistence. They are not fit to live among people. These Roma are animals and they behave like animals.”¹²⁰ His article placed blame on the Roma community for the New Year’s Eve stabbing of two men during a nightclub fight in Szigethalom, a town near Budapest. He added that Roma “are incapable of human communication. Inarticulate sounds pour out of their bestial skulls. [...] These animals shouldn’t be allowed to exist. In no way. That needs to be solved –immediately and regardless of the method.” Although he later claimed, “I want every honorable Gypsy to get on in life in this country and for every Gypsy unable and unfit to live in society to be cast out of society,” opposition parties called for his expulsion from the Fidesz party on account of his vicious verbal attacks on a minority group.¹²¹
45. In 2011, the Outlaws’ Army made the following announcement: “It is unnecessary to ask us to go out somewhere because there are problems with the gypsies. Our few hundred men cannot and will not keep the order throughout the country – that otherwise would be the duty of the police in a normal country and not that of ours. The gypsies are troubling everywhere. [...] Email inquiries asking or ordering us to break one’s leg or murder someone will immediately be deleted. [...] Not to mention that if one wants to break the other’s leg, then he shall be a man and break it himself, but not to ask us. We are aware that our group is under the surveillance of authorities, thus we are also going to use our mind, not just our fist.”¹²²
46. In April 2010, Gabor Vona, declared: “In terms of the Gypsy issue, the situation in certain parts of the country is akin to civil war. Now only drastic interventions are capable of helping. [...] We

¹¹⁹ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, *EU-MIDIS –European Union Minorities and Discrimination Survey – main result report*, 2009. http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra_uploads/663-FRA-2011_EU_MIDIS_EN.pdf.

¹²⁰ *Hungarian anti-Gypsy politician expelled from ruling party*, January 14, 2013. <http://www.travellerstimes.org.uk/list.aspx?c=00619ef1-21e2-40aa-8d5e-f7c38586d32f&n=af2d4b72-8521-4abe-9f1a-14cb1006e173>. Accessed on June 23, 2013.

¹²¹ *Hungary’s alarming climate of intolerance*, January 18, 2013. <http://globalpublicsquare.blogs.cnn.com/2013/01/18/hungarys-alarming-climate-of-intolerance/>. Accessed on June 23, 2013.

¹²² Hate groups maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/33>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

must produce an environment in which Gypsy people can return to a world of work, laws and education. And for those unwilling to do so, two alternatives remain: they can either choose to take advantage of the right of free movement granted by the EU and leave the country, because we will simply no longer put up with lifestyles dedicated to freeloading or criminality; or, there is always prison.”¹²³

47. In 2009, Máté Szabó, Parliamentary Commissioner for Civil Rights, referred to the Roma as a “collectivist, almost tribal level social group” and emphasized their “criminality categorized on an ethnic basis” and “Gypsy crime.”¹²⁴

48. In 2007, at the first Hungarian Guard demonstration in Tatárszentgyörgy, a Jobbik representative stated that the “Roma community possessed negative traits that were ethnically, racially, or biologically based.”¹²⁵

Summary

49. In the 2010 UN Human Rights Council’s concluding observations about Hungary, the committee states that it is concerned about the “virulent and widespread statements of public figures, the media, and members of the disbanded Magyar Garda.” It makes clear recommendations for Hungary to ensure that judges, magistrates, and all law enforcement officials are well trained to detect hate and racially motivated crimes. It also asks Hungary to ensure that members of the Hungarian Guard are investigated and prosecuted.¹²⁶

5.5. Development of events that suggest a trajectory towards the perpetration of violence

Racially motivated crimes, violence and attacks

50. Discrimination against Roma has escalated into violence and physical assaults due to political leaders who incite hatred against the Roma through racist attitudes and discourse. Extreme violence, both physical and psychological, against Roma takes many forms, such as the killing or injuring of Roma victims, the use of firearms, firebombs or Molotov cocktails, and the humiliation of Romani children and adults. From 2008 to 2012, the ERRC recorded 61 attacks against Roma that led to the deaths of seven adults and two children. Two cases involved grenades and 12

¹²³ Hungary party to follow European extremism’s move away from fringes, April 8, 2010.

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2010/apr/08/jobik-hungary-move-from-fringes>. Accessed on June 23, 2013.

¹²⁴ Hungarian Rights Groups Denounce Anti-Romani Statements by Hungary’s Parliamentary Commissioner for Civil Rights, April 6, 2009.

<http://www.errc.org/article/hungarian-rights-groups-denounce-anti-romani-statements-by-hungarys-parliamentary-commissioner-for-civil-rights/3025>. Accessed on June 5, 2013.

¹²⁵ President condemns Hungarian Guard amid wider calls, December 13, 2007.

<http://www.politics.hu/20071213/president-condemns-hungarian-guard-amid-wider-calls/>. Accessed on June 5, 2013.

¹²⁶ UN, Concluding Observations on Hungary <http://daccess-dds-ny.un.org/doc/UNDOC/GEN/G10/466/91/PDF/G1046691.pdf?OpenElement> (pg. 5, recommendation no 18).

involved Molotov cocktails.¹²⁷ From 2008 to 2009, Amnesty International also reported nine attacks, in which six people died.¹²⁸

51. In July 2012 in Debrecen, the New Hungarian Guard held a hostile demonstration against the Roma community to curb “Gypsy terror.”¹²⁹
52. In June 2012 in Sajohidveg, 19 Roma families received racist letters from anonymous senders containing threatening messages such as: “Better future and a clean, white Hungary!”; “Stinky Gypsy you will die with your entire family!”; “You will die, Gypsies, you will die!” The letters contained symbols of the Jobbik party, but the Party denied any connection to the incident.¹³⁰ The mayor of the village, Győző Takács, reported the incident to the Police Headquarters of Miskolc and asked for police patrols in the locality. The police have started an investigation on the basis of incitement to hatred against members of a community.
53. On April 18, 2012 in Nyiregyhaza, an adult man attacked a Roma family with a four-year-old child, screaming: “Why are you here, dirty gypsies? You are going to die.” The police stated that this attack was not racially motivated.¹³¹
54. In April 2011, 180 members of the NPFHCGA in groups of eight to 10 people patrolled Hajduhadhaz. Roughly one-quarter (3,000/12,000) of the inhabitants are Roma. Members were reportedly wearing black military clothing, intimidating local Roma residents, and filming them in their homes and gardens. The ERRC claims that these tactics were similar to the demonstration held in Gyongyospata in March 2011.¹³²
55. Since March 2011, members of the Gyongyospata Roma community have been continuously threatened and harassed by paramilitary groups. Members of the NPFHCGA organization have patrolled the town of Gyongyospata to ensure the public safety of citizens of Hungarian origin. Romani residents have been threatened with weapons and dogs and followed out of their homes. There has been no reported police intervention.¹³³

¹²⁷ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, 2012.
<http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

¹²⁸ Amnesty International, *Violent attacks against Roma in Hungary. Time to investigate racial motivation*, 2010.
http://www.amnesty.at/uploads/tx_amnesty/Violent_attacks_against_Roma_in_Hungary_report_web_02.pdf.

¹²⁹ Hate groups maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/42#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹³⁰ *Threatening Anti-Roma letters in Sajóhídvég*, June 4, 2012.

<http://www.red-network.eu/?i=red-network.en.items&id=843>. Accessed on May 21, 2013.

¹³¹ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, 2012.
<http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

¹³² NGOs letter to the Hungarian institutions urging for reactions on the patrols organized by paramilitary group, April 14, 2011. <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/hungary-hajduhadhaz-letter-english-14-april-2011.pdf>. Accessed on September 5, 2013.

¹³³ Hungarian Government urged to protect Roma from the harassment and intimidation, March 18, 2011.
<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/2011/03/18/hungarian-government-urged-to-protect-roma-from-harassment-and-intimidation/>. Accessed on May 17, 2013.

56. In March 2011, more than 1,000 residents of Gyongyospata signed a manifesto that demanded the functioning of the NPFHCGA, arguing that the institutions in place were incapable of enforcing order.¹³⁴
57. On March 6, 2011, the Jobbik party organized an anti-Roma march in Gyongyospata with nearly 2,000 participants. Three vigilante groups patrolled the village for almost a month afterward, threatening, intimidating and harassing the Roma community.¹³⁵ Paramilitary and extremist groups, along with Jobbik leaders, moved into Gyongyospata armed with axes, whips, and bulldogs.¹³⁶
58. On March 4, 2011, masked men dressed in black uniforms assaulted an eight-month pregnant Roma woman. The perpetrators chased the woman while carrying whips and spitting on her. After running away from the perpetrators, the woman delivered her baby one month before term, a possible result of the psychological stress and fear brought on by the attack.¹³⁷ The Hungarian Civil Liberties Union submitted an official report of the attack, but the police stated that they “did not find racial motivation in the attack.”¹³⁸
59. On April 26, 2011 in Gyongyospata, supporters of Vederó, an extreme right group, attacked a 14-year-old Romani boy and threatened him with guns and stones, in addition to provoking the local Roma community.¹³⁹
60. During the Easter weekend of April 2011, the Red Cross helped Romani women and children from Gyongyospata relocate from their settlement in order to alleviate their fears of living within the community.¹⁴⁰ The ERRC, Amnesty International, and Human Rights First sent a letter to the Hungarian Government asking them “to intervene and protect the Romani residents of Gyongyospata from the intimidation and harassment they have been subjected to by the vigilante organization, NPFHCGA, since 1 March.”¹⁴¹

¹³⁴ *Town residents sign petition supporting right-wing civic guard group*, March 18, 2011.

<http://www.politics.hu/2011/03/18/town-residents-sign-petition-supporting-rightwing-civic-guard-group/>. Accessed on May 17, 2013.

¹³⁵ Gyöngyöspata witness, Jobbik guard bring fear.

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3sVARTmITHk>. Accessed on May 17, 2013.

¹³⁶ *Poor, abused and second-class: the Roma living in fear in Hungarian village*, January 27, 2012.

<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2012/jan/27/hungary-roma-living-in-fear>. Accessed on May 13, 2013.

¹³⁷ ERRC, *Written comments by the European Roma Rights Center concerning Hungary for consideration by the Commission on Security and Cooperation in Europe*, U.S. Helsinki Commission, 2013.

http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=11&ved=0CC4QFjAAOAo&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.csce.gov%2Findex.cfm%3Ffuseaction%3DFiles.Download%26FileStore_id%3D2321&ei=gLF6Ub7JE8rJ0AHatIHI

<http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

¹³⁸ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, 2012.

¹³⁹ Idem.

¹⁴⁰ *Shadow Report about the Events at Gyöngyöspata*, November 14, 2011.

<http://tasz.hu/en/news/shadow-report-about-events-gyongyospata>. Accessed on May 13, 2013.

¹⁴¹ *Rights Groups Demand Protection for Hungarian Roma*, March 17, 2011.

<http://www.errc.org/article/rights-groups-demand-protection-for-hungarian-roma/3816>. Accessed on May 13, 2013.

61. On November 30, 2011, shots were fired at Oszkár Juhász, the Mayor of Gyongyospata. Juhász had arranged space for paramilitary groups, specifically the New Hungarian Guard, in the village. In response to the shooting, the Jobbik Deputy Chairman Tamas Sneider stated that: “[The Jobbik] cannot be intimidated. [...] ‘Certain circles’ are unhappy that local leaders can present a positive example in Gyöngyöspata and in several Jobbik-run villages. [...] ‘Miracles can be achieved’ with a strong mayor, notary and police force in crime-fighting and prevention. ‘These circles’ do not want to see order established in Hungary,” he said.¹⁴²
62. In November 2012, Amnesty International issued a public statement¹⁴³ criticizing a March 2011 report by the Parliamentary ad-hoc Committee that addressed the vigilante activities in the village of Gyongyospata a year prior.¹⁴⁴ Amnesty International stated that the Hungarian authorities neglected to address the human rights abuses suffered by the Roma. Furthermore, that the Parliamentary ad-hoc Committee report failed to mention the insufficiency of the police action and the delay of public authorities in responding to the abuses. In his official report,¹⁴⁵ the Hungarian Ombudsman on National Minorities’ leveled similar criticisms against the investigation. According to the Hungarian Civil Liberties Union, “the position of the minority ombudsman was terminated at the end of 2011,” a few weeks after the report was made public.¹⁴⁶
63. On September 4, 2010, a Roma outhouse in Jaszapati was set on fire. Prior to the fire, a threatening message was written on the house declaring, “You will die gypsies.” The family also reported that the perpetrators had previously tried to light the house on fire.¹⁴⁷
64. In November 2009, a local politician from Sajobabony requested the support of the Jobbik party to “make some order” in the locality. Jobbik representatives organized a public hearing in which the Hungarian Guard also participated. A conflict began when Romani residents of Sajobabony were barred from entering the public hearing. According to the ERRC report, the police intervened to prevent physical clashes, but they mainly focused on defending the Jobbik and the Hungarian Guard. The following day, the Hungarian Guard sent a convoy to the Roma community, inciting another incident. The lead vehicle of the convoy drove off the road and into the group of Roma, who had gathered to watch the convoy’s approach. The Roma began to hit the car with sticks and

¹⁴² *Shots fired at Gyöngyöspata mayor*, November 30, 2011.

<http://www.politics.hu/2011/11/30/shots-fired-at-gyongyospata-mayor/>. Accessed on May 15, 2013.

¹⁴³ *Hungary: Report into vigilante activities in Gyöngyöspata fails to address discrimination*, April 4, 2012.

<http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/EUR27/001/2012/en/0121017f-0569-43d4-b123-d5f028f669de/eur270012012en.pdf>. Accessed on May 15, 2013.

¹⁴⁴ According to Amnesty International, on 6 March 2011 the Jobbik party organized an anti-Roma march in Gyöngyöspata where up to 2,000 people participated. Three vigilante groups patrolled the village for almost a month, threatening, intimidating and harassing Roma community. See <http://www.amnesty.org/en/library/asset/EUR27/001/2012/en/0121017f-0569-43d4-b123-d5f028f669de/eur270012012en.pdf>. Accessed on May 15, 2013.

¹⁴⁵ TASZ, http://tasz.hu/files/tasz/imce/kallai_report_on_gyongyospata_-_summary.pdf, Accessed on November 5, 2013.

¹⁴⁶ *Report on Gyöngyöspata Marks the Final Goodbye of the Minority Ombudsman*, January 31, 2012.

<http://tasz.hu/en/news/report-gyongyospata-marks-final-goodbye-minority-ombudsman>. Accessed on May 23, 2013.

¹⁴⁷ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, 2012.

<http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

axes. The police arrested several Roma on the spot. More were arrested later and accused of committing hate crimes and property damage.¹⁴⁸

65. On August 3, 2009, during one of the anti-Roma attacks that took place in Kistela village, several armed men entered a Roma house, shot a Romani woman to death,¹⁴⁹ and injured her 13-year-old daughter.¹⁵⁰ Four men were arrested.
66. In July 2009 in Miskolc, 300 supporters of the Hungarian Guard gathered to protest the group's (legal) disbanding. The Budapest Metropolitan Court issued the decision earlier in July after the Guard held its first anti-Roma march in Tatárszentgyörgy, which later became the site of one of the Roma serial killings and other anti-Roma violence (see paragraphs 76-77).¹⁵¹
67. On the evening of May 27, 2009, a perpetrator with a history of making anti-Roma statements broke into a Roma family house in Abadszalok. He slashed the neck and the chest of a Romani man and the legs of a Romani woman.¹⁵²
68. On May 5, 2009, shots were fired into a house inhabited by Roma in Taska. The local leaders claimed that this incident was not the first attack on that community.¹⁵³
69. On April 22, 2009, a racially motivated attack on a 54-year-old Roma man was reported in Tiszalok.¹⁵⁴ The National Bureau of Investigation took over this case¹⁵⁵ and connected the incident with attacks in Tatárszentgyörgy (2009) and Nagycséc (2008).¹⁵⁶
70. In April 2009, as a result of harassment from the Hungarian Guard, 38 Roma people from Janoshalma were forced to live in the forest for several weeks. The mayor asked them to leave the village and the country. They subsequently traveled to Strasbourg, France to request asylum.¹⁵⁷
71. On the night of March 13, 2009, three men threw a Molotov fire bomb under the window of a Roma house in Kecskemet.¹⁵⁸ The bomb, which did not explode,¹⁵⁹ was discovered by the family in the morning.

¹⁴⁸ Idem.

¹⁴⁹ Human Rights First, *Select Cases of Violence against Roma in Hungary 2008-2009*.

<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/FD-080609-cases-violence-against-roma-hungary-08-09.pdf>.

¹⁵⁰ *Roma woman shot dead in latest Hungary attack*, August 3, 2009.

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2009/08/03/idUSL362272>. Accessed on May 27, 2013.

¹⁵¹ *Magyar Gárda rallies in Miskolc to protest ban*, July 13, 2009.

<http://www.politics.hu/20090713/magyar-garda-rallies-in-miskolc-to-protest-ban/>. Accessed on May 27, 2013.

¹⁵² Human Rights First, *Select Cases of Violence against Roma in Hungary 2008-2009*.

<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/FD-080609-cases-violence-against-roma-hungary-08-09.pdf>.

¹⁵³ Idem.

¹⁵⁴ *Tiszalök: Roma man killed by gunshot*, April 22, 2009.

<http://www.red-network.eu/?i=red-network.en.items&id=464>. Accessed on May 27, 2013.

¹⁵⁵ OSCE, ODIHR, *Addressing violence, promoting integration. Field assessment of violent incidents against Roma in Hungary: key developments, findings and recommendations*, 2009. <http://www.osce.org/odihr/68545>.

¹⁵⁶ Human Rights First, *Select Cases of Violence against Roma in Hungary 2008-2009*.

<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/FD-080609-cases-violence-against-roma-hungary-08-09.pdf>.

¹⁵⁷ *Antifa-Hungary, Attacks against Roma in Hungary January 2008-June 2009*, 2009. <http://antifa-hungary.blogspot.com/2009/11/attacks-against-roma-in-hungary-january.html>.

72. On February 23, 2009, a racially motivated killing occurred in Tatárszentgyörgy. A four-year-old Roma child and his 27-year-old father were both shot dead while trying to escape a house set on fire by Molotov cocktails.¹⁶⁰ Although there was evidence of a crime, the police initially investigated the case as an accident caused by a short circuit fire, not as a criminal offense. Later that day, the police report was changed after the results of the autopsy confirmed that the victims had died of gunshot wounds. According to a report by ERRC, the Legal Defense Bureau for National and Ethnic Minorities, and the Hungarian Civil Liberties Union, there were several examples of official misconduct by the police, firefighters, and emergency medical personnel who worked on the case. The report requested that the authorities pursue the following course of action: disclose the results of all disciplinary actions against officials; clarify the steps taken to investigate the misconduct and prevent similar mistakes in the future; provide an update to the public regarding the investigation of the crimes; investigate the possibility of racist motivation in the crime; and ensure that law enforcement agencies receive appropriate training to address racially motivated crimes according to international standards.¹⁶¹ A letter was sent to the Prime Minister, Minister of Justice, and Hungarian Chief of Police calling on law enforcement to deploy all necessary resources to investigate and prosecute the brutal murder of two Roma.¹⁶² In 2013, a man was convicted to 13 years in prison and four men were convicted to life in prison for six racially motivated killings, including the killings in Tatárszentgyörgy.¹⁶³
73. Three weeks after the Tatárszentgyörgy killings, three Roma attacked a car that contained a canister of gas near their home. The occupants of the car – one of whom had documented ties to racial extremists – suffered minor injuries. The Miskolc City Court sentenced the three Roma who attacked the car to 34 years of imprisonment based on the argument that the attack was racially motivated. The Hungarian Helsinki Committee and the Hungarian Civil Liberties Union disagreed with the court’s decision and argued that the court had “once again misinterpreted and erroneously applied laws on hate crime,” since the classification of an act as “violence against a member of the community” requires the crime to be motivated by prejudice against a group.¹⁶⁴ In this case, the

¹⁵⁸ Idem.

¹⁵⁹ ERRC, *Written comments of the European Roma Rights Center, Chance for Children Foundation and the Hungarian Helsinki Committee concerning Hungary for the consideration of the United Nations Committee at its 100th session.* http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrc/docs/ngos/ERRC-Hungary_HRC100.pdf.

¹⁶⁰ Amnesty International. *Violent attacks against Roma in Hungary - Time to investigate racial motivation*, 2012. http://www.amnesty.at/uploads/tx_amnesty/Violent_attacks_against_Roma_in_Hungary_report_web_02.pdf.

¹⁶¹ ERRC, HCLU, NEKI, *Report on the circumstances of the double murder committed at Tatárszentgyörgy on 23 February 2009 and conduct of the acting authorities (the police, ambulance and fire services)*, 2009. <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/media/03/DA/m000003DA.pdf>.

¹⁶² ERRC letter to the Hungarian institutions concerning the brutal murder of Robert and Robika Csorba, in Tatárszentgyörgy, March 3, 2009. <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/media/03/B1/m000003B1.pdf>. Accessed on June 6, 2013.

¹⁶³ *Life in Jail for Racist Killers in Hungary, Poor Outlook for Georgia's Economy*, August 7, 2013. <http://www.tol.org/client/article/23892-life-in-jail-for-racist-killers-in-hungary-poor-outlook-for-georgias-economy.html>. Accessed on August 10, 2013

¹⁶⁴ *Romas Sentenced for Hate Crime Against Hungarians*, July 13, 2012. <http://tasz.hu/en/node/2786>. Accessed on June 6, 2013.

Roma defendants did not attack the car because Hungarians were inside, but rather because those riding in the car were presumed to be extremists.¹⁶⁵

74. Two Roma adolescents were injured as a result of shots fired in front of a Roma house in Alsószolca on December 15, 2008.¹⁶⁶ A young boy was struck two times and suffered serious life-threatening injuries.¹⁶⁷ A young girl suffered minor injuries.¹⁶⁸
75. On November 28, 2008, during a candlelight march organized in Kiskunlacháza, the mayor of the locality addressed a 3,000-person audience that included 300 members of the Hungarian Guard,¹⁶⁹ stating: “There is no room for violence in Kiskunlacháza, there is no room for criminals, there has been enough of the violence by the Roma in Kiskunlacháza. [...] Yet we are the majority.”¹⁷⁰
76. On November 18, 2008 in Pecs, a hand grenade was thrown into a Roma inhabited house, injuring four members of a family: two adults and two children. The parents died and the two children, aged three and five, suffered minor physical injuries and shock.¹⁷¹
77. On the evening of November 3, 2008, a Roma family was attacked with Molotov cocktails and firearms in Nagycséc. As a result, a 43-year-old Romani man and a 40-year-old Romani woman were killed.¹⁷² A firebomb that failed to explode was thrown into another Roma home.¹⁷³ After the incident, Victoria Mohácsi, a Roma Member of the European Parliament from Hungary (mandate from 2004 to 2009) promptly appealed to the Hungarian authorities to take action, stating, “I hope the death of two people will finally prompt the authorities to show responsibility in examining racist motivation.”¹⁷⁴ On that day in Galgagyörk, two other Roma people were killed in a racially motivated attack targeting two Roma houses.¹⁷⁵

¹⁶⁵ Idem.

¹⁶⁶ *Series of violent attacks against Roma in Hungary in 2008-2009.*

<http://www.red-network.eu/?i=red-network.en.items&id=396>. Accessed on June 11, 2013.

¹⁶⁷ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, 2012.

<http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

¹⁶⁸ *Series of violent attacks against Roma in Hungary in 2008-2009*, <http://www.red-network.eu/?i=red-network.en.items&id=396>. Accessed on June 11, 2013.

¹⁶⁹ Antifa-Hungary, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary January 2008-June 2009*, 2009. <http://antifa-hungary.blogspot.com/2009/11/attacks-against-roma-in-hungary-january.html>.

¹⁷⁰ MRG concerned over Hungarian mayor insisting on his anti-Roma statements, February 11, 2011.

<http://www.refworld.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/rwmain?page=country&category=&publisher=MRGI&type=&coi=HUN&rid=&docid=4dfb655113&skip=0>.
¹⁷¹ <http://www.osce.org/odihr/68545>. Accessed on June 25, 2013.

¹⁷² *Series of violent attacks against Roma in Hungary in 2008-2009*, <http://www.red-network.eu/?i=red-network.en.items&id=396>. Accessed on June 11, 2013.

¹⁷³ OSCE, ODIHR, *Addressing violence, promoting integration. Field assessment of violent incidents against Roma in Hungary: key developments, findings and recommendations*, 2009. <http://www.osce.org/odihr/68545>.

¹⁷⁴ *Two killed in attack on Roma houses in Hungary*, November 3, 2008.

<http://dalje.com/en-world/two-killed-in-attack-on-roma-houses-in-hungary/199591>. Accessed on June 25, 2013.

¹⁷⁵ Human Rights First, *Select Cases of Violence against Roma in Hungary 2008-2009*.

<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/FD-080609-cases-violence-against-roma-hungary-08-09.pdf>.

78. On September 29, 2008, four Roma households were attacked with Molotov cocktails and guns in Tarnabod.¹⁷⁶ No one was injured.
79. On September 17, 2008, during an attack with a hand grenade, a Roma house was destroyed in Siofok.¹⁷⁷ Two years later, on the evening of March 18, attacks with Molotov cocktails were reportedly¹⁷⁸ carried out on four Roma houses in Siofok on three different streets.¹⁷⁹
80. On September 5, 2008, a Roma family was attacked with guns in Nyiradony. Shots were fired, but no one was injured.¹⁸⁰
81. On August 19, 2008, a group of self-declared “skinheads” attacked a Roma household from Szekesfehervar with stones. A 12-year-old Romani girl was injured.¹⁸¹ The perpetrators were arrested by the police.
82. On August 8, 2008, two Roma households in Piricse were attacked with Molotov cocktails and guns.¹⁸² As a result, a Romani woman suffered a gunshot wound in the leg.¹⁸³
83. On the night of July 21, 2008, three Roma houses were attacked with shotguns in Szigetvar Galgagyork.¹⁸⁴
84. On June 15, 2008, a man killed a 14-year-old Romani boy in Fenyestlitke.¹⁸⁵ The perpetrator also threatened that he would “kill all the Roma in the village.”
85. On June 3, 2008, Molotov cocktails were thrown into three Roma households in Patka.¹⁸⁶ The perpetrators were volunteer police guards.¹⁸⁷
86. The Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe released a motion for a recommendation on “Roma asylum seekers in Council of Europe member states.” In the recommendation, the

¹⁷⁶ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, 2012.

<http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

¹⁷⁷ Antifa-Hungary, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary January 2008-June 2009*, 2009. <http://antifa-hungary.blogspot.com/2009/11/attacks-against-roma-in-hungary-january.html>.

¹⁷⁸ Human Rights First, *Blueprint. Combating violence against Roma in Hungary*, 2010.

<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/HungaryBlueprint.pdf>.

¹⁷⁹ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, 2012.

<http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>.

¹⁸⁰ Amnesty International, *Violent attacks against Roma in Hungary - Time to investigate racial motivation*, 2012.

http://www.amnesty.at/uploads/tx_amnesty/Violent_attacks_against_Roma_in_Hungary_report_web_02.pdf.

¹⁸¹ Human Rights First, *Select Cases of Violence against Roma in Hungary 2008-2009*.

<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/FD-080609-cases-violence-against-roma-hungary-08-09.pdf>.

¹⁸² Amnesty International, *Violent attacks against Roma in Hungary- Time to investigate racial motivation*, 2012.

http://www.amnesty.at/uploads/tx_amnesty/Violent_attacks_against_Roma_in_Hungary_report_web_02.pdf.

¹⁸³ *Series of violent attacks against Roma in Hungary in 2008-2009*. <http://www.red-network.eu/?i=red-network.en.items&id=396>.

¹⁸⁴ Human Rights First, *Select Cases of Violence against Roma in Hungary 2008-2009*.

<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/FD-080609-cases-violence-against-roma-hungary-08-09.pdf>.

¹⁸⁵ Idem.

¹⁸⁶ Idem.

¹⁸⁷ Human Rights First, “Select Cases of Violence Against Roma in Hungary 2008-2009.”

<http://www.humanrightsfirst.org/wp-content/uploads/pdf/FD-080609-cases-violence-against-roma-hungary-08-09.pdf>.

Parliamentary Assembly stated that “during 2007-2009, eight Roma have been killed through this form of racist violence in the countries mentioned, six of whom [are] in Hungary alone.” The Assembly recommended “the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe set up a working group with the task of urgently addressing the issue of Roma asylum seekers, including from Czech Republic, Hungary and Slovakia, with a view to propose an action plan for immediate implementation.”¹⁸⁸

87. In terms of anti-Semitic events, the Guardians of Carpathian Homeland Movement and the Guard Federation organized a rally in 2012 against the Jewish community and used slogans such as “Filthy Jews” or “To Auschwitz with all of you.” Balazs Lenhardt, an independent member of the Hungarian Parliament (and former member of the Jobbik party), burned an Israeli flag during the event. He was arrested but released immediately due to his parliamentary immunity. Desecrations of Jewish cemeteries and acts of vandalism of synagogues have also been documented by the media and NGOs.

Summary

88. There have been increased reports of hate speech as well as actions by extremist groups and their leaders. Hate-motivated killings, stigmatization of Romani people, discriminatory practices at both the individual and structural levels, and social and economic exclusion are also increasingly prevalent in Hungary. However, there is no official data on race-based crimes and extremism in Hungary. Experts have also pointed to the lack of statistics on the application of provisions of the Criminal Code and relevant data disaggregated by ethnicity.¹⁸⁹ Although NGOs have systematically collected data and sent this information to national institutions, the Agency for Fundamental Rights’ 2012 report, “Making hate crime visible in the EU: acknowledging victims’ rights,” showed that Hungary did not collect or release official data about hate motivated crimes against Roma in 2010.¹⁹⁰
89. The increase in racially motivated crimes and violent attacks is a strong signal for action, but the Government’s response has been weak. Perpetrators and their followers are clearly emboldened by the fact that these actions have not sparked public outrage or strong and immediate governmental criticism. These actions are thus perceived as solutions and serve as a model for other citizens, organizations, and leaders. In 2007, however, at the initiative of the Hungarian Civil Liberties Union, 150 individuals signed a declaration against the anti-Roma marches of the Hungarian Guard.¹⁹¹

¹⁸⁸ Council of Europe, *Roma asylum seekers in Council of Europe member states. Motion for a recommendation*, October 15, 2009.

<http://www.assembly.coe.int/ASP/Doc/XrefViewHTML.asp?FileID=12333&Language=EN>.

¹⁸⁹ ECRI, *ECRI report on Hungary. Forth monitoring cycle*, 2009. <http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/country-by-country/hungary/HUN-CbC-IV-2009-003-ENG.pdf>.

¹⁹⁰ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, “Making hate crime visible in the European Union: acknowledging victims’ rights,” 2012. http://fra.europa.eu/sites/default/files/fra-2012_hate-crime.pdf.

¹⁹¹ Intellectuals against the Hungarian Guard, December 19, 2007. <http://tasz.hu/en/roma-program/intellectuals-against-hungarian-guard>.

90. The police in Hungary are responsible for recording and investigating crime, and establishing systems of crime prevention. Despite existing legal provisions barring hate crime and the fact that perpetrators have made public statements declaring the racial motivation of their actions, there have been low levels of prosecution for racially-motivated crimes. These low levels can be attributed “to the reluctance of the police, prosecutors and courts to investigate and acknowledge racial motivation in violent and nonviolent crimes against Roma.” ECRI established earlier in 2009 that Hungarian authorities are unwilling to accept the racial and anti-Semitic motivations behind these attacks and would prefer to consider these incidents as common offenses rather than hate crimes.¹⁹² In its fourth report on Hungary in 2009, ECRI stated that “it has been reported that, in some instances, even where there was strong enough evidence of racist motivations to support an indictment for racist violence, the offence was finally treated by the courts as having arisen solely out of a conflict situation rather than as having had racist motivations.”¹⁹³

Military trainings

91. According to the Global News Service of the Jewish People, a coalition of public figures asked the Hungarian Government to investigate the secret camps that were being organized by Neo-Nazi groups in 2009.¹⁹⁴

92. The Hungarian National Front “action groups” are training for armed combat.¹⁹⁵ From March 2012 to January 2013, military trainings on weapon usage, combat, and urban fighting were organized every month by the Hungarian National Front¹⁹⁶ in places such as Komlo, Kazincbarcika, Bony, Borsod County, Békés County, Nyíregyháza, Dombóvár, Kecskemét.¹⁹⁷ According to Junge Welt, during 10-14 of July, 2009, a military training was organized in Bony village. The admission policy said: “No entrance to gays, Jews and gypsies.”¹⁹⁸ A police spokesperson declared that they were investigating the case.

93. In June and September 2012, Pax Hungarica organized military trainings for the members of the organization.¹⁹⁹

94. In March 2012, the New Hungarian Guard held a military training camp in Fejer and Veszprem, where members learned about theoretical military education, and practiced formations and

¹⁹² Amnesty International. *Violent attacks against Roma in Hungary - Time to investigate racial motivation*, 2012. http://www.amnesty.at/uploads/tx_amnesty/Violent_attacks_against_Roma_in_Hungary_report_web_02.pdf.

¹⁹³ ECRI, *ECRI report on Hungary. Forth monitoring cycle*, 2009. <http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/country-by-country/hungary/HUN-CbC-IV-2009-003-ENG.pdf>.

¹⁹⁴ *Hungarian neo-Nazis reportedly holding secret camps*, September 7, 2009. <http://www.jta.org/news/article/2009/09/07/1007669/hungarian-neo-nazis-prepare-for-armed-struggle>.

¹⁹⁵ Hate Groups Maps, <http://athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/20>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹⁹⁶ *Hungarian neo-Nazis reportedly holding secret camps*, September 7, 2009. <http://www.jta.org/2009/09/07/news-opinion/world/hungarian-neo-nazis-reportedly-holding-secret-camps>.
¹⁹⁷ <http://www.jta.org/news/article/2009/09/07/1007669/hungarian-neo-nazis-prepare-for-armed-struggle>. Accessed on July 8, 2013.

¹⁹⁸ Hate Groups Maps, <http://athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/20>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

¹⁹⁹ Hungarian police probes alleged neo-Nazi camp, September 10, 2009. <http://www.eurojewcong.org/hungary/4391-hungarian-police-probes-alleged-neo-nazi-camp.html>. Accessed on June 10, 2013.

¹⁹⁹ Hate Groups Maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/32>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

performed shooting exercises. During that same month, the organization held a self-defense and formation group assembly in Pest County.²⁰⁰

95. In September 2011, the Hungarian National Guard, the National Protection Force, and the Civil Guard Association held joint-military training and discussed “possible ways of future collaboration.”²⁰¹

96. According to Contrarian Hungarian, the Outlaws Army also organizes military trainings for “a new generation of fighters.”²⁰²

Summary

97. Secret military trainings organized by neo-Nazi groups aiming “to create a new generation of fighters” have been reported by NGOs since 2009. The Wiesenthal Center made an inquiry to the Council of Europe where they warned that “Hungary is sinking into the abyss of racial hatred that could easily spread throughout this region” and urged the 47 members of the Council of Europe to investigate the neo-Nazi revival.²⁰³

98. Organizing military trainings on weapon usage, combat, and urban fighting flouts the rule of law and democracy. There is no information available about whether Hungarian institutions have investigated organizations and individuals involved in secret combat preparation.

5.6 Other triggering factors for violence

Events amounting to hate speech and hate crimes, especially by leaders and organized groups, leads to an inflammatory atmosphere and insecurity

99. According to the research institute Political Capital, there has been a notable increase in sympathy for far-right ideas and politics: approval rose from 10% in 2002 to 21% in 2009.²⁰⁴ In 2011, the International Radicalism Index placed Hungary as the fifth most radical country out of 33 countries surveyed and the Political Institute described the radicalism in Hungary as “a practically unprecedented rise by international standards.”²⁰⁵

²⁰⁰ Hate Groups Maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/42#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

²⁰¹ Hate Groups Maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/21#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

²⁰² Betyársereg (Outlaw’s Army)

<http://thecontrarianhungarian.wordpress.com/by-theme/hungarian-far-right/betyarsereg/> accessed on July 8, 2013.

²⁰³ *Hungarian neo-Nazi camps have large network*, September 9, 2009.

<http://www.jta.org/2009/09/09/news-opinion/world/hungarian-neo-nazi-camps-have-large-network>

²⁰⁴ *International “radicalism index” puts Hungary fifth of 33 countries; belief in genetic roots of Roma crime widespread*, December 5, 2011.

<http://www.politics.hu/2011/12/05/international-radicalism-index-puts-hungary-fifth-of-33-countries-belief-in-genetic-roots-of-roma-crime-widespread/>. Accessed on July 8, 2013.

²⁰⁵ Idem.

100. Founded in 2003, the extreme-right Jobbik party did not enter Parliament until 2009. In the 2006 election, Jobbik earned only 120,000 votes (2% of vote). In 2009, Jobbik won an unexpected victory in the European parliamentary elections, shocking its opponents. Jobbik sent three MEPs to the European Parliament, becoming the nation's third largest party and coming close to beating the governing Hungarian Socialist Party. In the 2010 elections, Jobbik's voter base increased eight-fold compared to four years earlier. The party gained 47 seats in the Parliament and won 16% of the popular vote with the support of over 850,000 people, making it one of the most popular parties in Hungary.
101. Gabor Vona claimed that in the upcoming year Jobbik will regain some of the support it lost in the 2012 December polls by holding more forums in busy public spaces. According to Vona, the priorities of the Jobbik campaign will be: reviving the Hungarian economy through the creation of jobs; enhancing public security through the creation of a gendarmerie force; defending the sovereignty of Hungary by preventing the sale of Hungarian land to foreigners; amending health care protocols; properly situating the Roma in the Hungarian "social stratum" and drawing national attention to the issue of acceptable "Hungarian-Roma co-existence;" and creating political ties with foreign nations whom he believes are strategically important – including Turkey, Russia, and Germany²⁰⁶. According to opinion polls, Jobbik is increasing in popularity. In 2013, Jobbik became the second most popular party with 19% of voter support (the threshold to enter Parliament is 5%).²⁰⁷ Parliamentary elections will be held in April 2014.²⁰⁸
102. The Jobbik party describes itself as "a principled, conservative and radically patriotic Christian party," whose fundamental purpose is the protection of Hungarian values and interests."²⁰⁹
103. Jobbik organized an anti-Roma march on the evening of January 12, 2013, in Szigethalom. Hundreds of people participated in a torchlight demonstration where Jobbik's Vice President János Volner stated that "only Jobbik can solve the problem of Gypsy crime after it has taken power." His response came after two athletes were stabbed at a sports club in Szigethalom on New Year's Eve, and a young Roma was a suspect. After demanding a more radical law enforcement approach towards the issue of "Gypsy crime," Jobbik spokesman Adam Mirkoczki referred to the attack as a "typical and vile example of Gypsy terror." Prior to the demonstration, he claimed that the purpose of the act was to show that "Hungarian society is not afraid and Jobbik will act against Gypsy crime."²¹⁰ János Volner warned that if such events kept occurring, his method of response would involve restraining "the Gypsies' multiplication." to help curb the serious economic consequences of these actions.

²⁰⁶ Vona says Jobbik to "strike back" after year of attacks and sliding poll numbers , December 20, 2012

<http://www.politics.hu/2012/12/20/vona-says-jobbik-to-strike-back-after-year-of-attacks-and-sliding-poll-numbers/>

²⁰⁷ Another poll by Median puts Jobbik ahead of the socialists, February 27, 2013.

<http://www.hungarianambiance.com/2013/02/another-poll-by-median-puts-jobbik.html>. Accessed on July 8, 2013.

²⁰⁸ Election Guide-Hungary. <http://www.electionguide.org/country.php?ID=99>. Accessed on July 8, 2013.

²⁰⁹ http://www.jobbik.com/short_summary_about_jobbik. Accessed on July 8, 2013.

²¹⁰ Jobbik to hold demonstration against "Gypsy terror" after countryside stabbing, April 1, 2013.

<http://www.politics.hu/2013/01/04/jobbik-to-hold-demo-against-gypsy-terror-after-countryside-stabbing/>. Accessed on September 2, 2013.

104. In November 2012, the New Hungarian Guard joined a Jobbik demonstration in front of the Israeli Embassy in Budapest. Authorities did not take any action against the extremists, even though the demonstrators were wearing the uniforms of the disbanded Guard.²¹¹
105. In October 2012, Gabor Vona said that he would encourage Brussels's politicians, the ones who "teach us integration," to "take with themselves some 300,000 Roma, integrate them and give them back to us only afterwards." He said "the truth must be stated, which is that the Roma in Hungary do not want to integrate, but have [...] [become] accustomed to living on benefits, outside the law."²¹²
106. In a demonstration held by a parliamentary group in September 2012, the New Hungarian Guard announced that it "will act intimidatingly towards the guilty and the criminals if it has to."²¹³ During another demonstration organized by a parliamentary party in May 2012, the leader of the New Hungarian Guard claimed that the group would "support local communities to form local vigilant organizations to defend themselves."²¹⁴
107. In August 2012, the New Hungarian Guard hosted hostile rallies at Cegléd against the local Roma community. A group of 50-60 individuals marched in Cegléd and threatened Roma people on the streets as a response to an alleged attack by local Romani families against Garda members. The protest required 70-80 police officers to block access to Roma houses.²¹⁵ As a result of the violence and anti-Roma sentiment, local Roma leaders condemned this demonstration as a hate crime and declared a state of emergency for the Roma in Cegléd.²¹⁶
108. During the extremist "Magyar Sziget" festival, organized in August 2011, the leader of the Outlaws Army Zsolt Tyirityán stated, "someone must get to the stage where they are capable of pulling the trigger on a rifle, perhaps upon seeing someone with different skin color," and that a "war of races" was underway in Hungary.²¹⁷
109. On August 5, 2011, Jobbik, the Outlaw Army, and other extremist groups organized a 1,000-person anti-Roma protest in the main square of Devecser,²¹⁸ a city of 5,000 inhabitants. The slogan of the protest was "Live and allow to live – protest for legitimate self-defence" and

²¹¹ Hate Groups Maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/42#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

²¹² *Jobbik holds protest against communist era crimes; calls for prosecution of former officials*, October 1, 2012. <http://www.politics.hu/20121001/jobik-holds-protest-against-communist-era-crimes-calls-for-prosecution-of-former-communist-officials/>. Accessed on June 15, 2013.

²¹³ Hate Groups Maps, <http://www.athenainstitute.eu/en/map/olvas/42#read>. Accessed on September 3, 2013.

²¹⁴ Idem.

²¹⁵ http://www.neki.hu/index.php?option=com_content&view=section&layout=blog&id=14&Itemid=91

²¹⁶ *Statement from Roma leaders re: violence in Cegléd*, August 20, 2012.

<http://romasolidaritynews.wordpress.com/2012/08/21/statement-from-roma-leaders-re-violence-in-cegled/>. Accessed on June 19, 2013.

²¹⁷ US ambassador welcomes probe into Magyar Sziget speech, August 30, 2011.

<http://www.politics.hu/20110830/us-ambassador-welcomes-probe-into-magyar-sziget-speech/>. Accessed on June 19, 2013.

²¹⁸ ERRC, *Attacks against Roma in Hungary: January 2008-September 2012*, <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/attacks-list-in-hungary.pdf>

advocated for the re-introduction of the death penalty in Hungary.²¹⁹ Three elected members of the Hungarian Parliament, on behalf of Jobbik, participated at the event. In his speech, Gábor Ferenczi, an elected parliament member, advised the audience to ask support from the paramilitary organization Defense Force²²⁰ on the situation of Gypsy stealing and cheating.²²¹ The other speakers made anti-Roma remarks and the protesters chanted: “You are no-ones!” and “You are going to die, gypsies, you are going to die here!”

110. In August 2010, Marton Szegedi, the Jobbik candidate for Mayor of Miskolc, proposed to “banish Roma criminals” in the city.²²²
111. Under a recent legislative amendment in parliament, patrolling requires a permit. Therefore, the increasingly frequent marches of organized Jobbik gendarmes should constitute a crime punishable with imprisonment. In response to this legislative amendment, Jobbik’s “civil volunteers” declared that they will continue “walking around” – instead of patrolling – in the neighborhoods they find particularly prone to criminality (i.e. Roma populated areas).
112. On several occasions the NGO community and media have recorded anti-Semitic statements and demonstrations aimed at increasing the inflammatory atmosphere. In 2010, prior to elections, a member of the Jobbik Party released to the public a genetic test that supposedly proved he had no Roma or Jewish roots. The Medical Research Council from Hungary said that the test violated the country’s law on genetics, as it did not serve any medical purposes.²²³ Another Jobbik member, also a representative in the European Parliament, made anti-Semitic statements upon discovering he had Jewish roots. “I’m not saying I wasn’t surprised by this news,” he declared. “[It] will probably take some time for me to come to terms with these events.”²²⁴ In April 2010,

²¹⁹ *Jobbik protests for death penalty*, August 6, 2012.

<http://www.politics.hu/20120806/jobbik-protests-for-death-penalty/>. Accessed on September 13, 2013.

²²⁰ Defence Force participated at the Gyöngyöspata incident in 2011. According to Huffington Post in April 2011, the Hungarian Red Cross “evacuated 277 people from the village of Gyongyospata by bus to other parts of Hungary because the local Roma are concerned about potential confrontations with members of the Vederó, or Defense Force.”

(http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2011/04/22/vedero-hungary-roma-_n_852491.html). Prior to be closed down by the provider, the Defence Force website mentioned that their military training camp was open to “all youths and adults who love their country and who are interested in learning military and self-defense basics.”

(<http://www.foxnews.com/world/2011/04/22/roma-hungary-leave-town-escape-vigilantes/>)

²²¹ “*We Attacked the Gypsies, And We Are Proud of It*”: *Extreme Right Demonstration Gets Violent in Devecser, Hungary*, August 8, 2012.

<http://thecontrarianhungarian.wordpress.com/2012/08/08/we-attacked-the-gypsies-and-we-are-proud-of-it-extreme-right-demonstration-gets-violent-in-devecser-hungary/>. Accessed on June 19, 2013.

²²² *Socialists outraged by Jobbik mayoral candidate’s call to banish Roma criminals*, August 26,

2010. <http://www.politics.hu/20100826/socialists-outraged-by-jobbik-mayoral-candidates-call-to-banish-roma-criminals/>. Accessed on May 1, 2013.

²²³ *Hungary’s Rising Hyper-Nationalist Jobbik Party and the Legacy of Anti-Semitism and Anti-Gypsyism*, June 25, 2012. <http://geocurrents.info/place/europe/hungarys-rising-hyper-nationalist-jobbik-party-and-the-legacy-of-anti-semitism-and-anti-gypsyism>. Accessed on May 1, 2013.

²²⁴ MEP of antisemitic Hungarian party discovers he is Jewish, July 5, 2012.

<http://www.thejc.com/news/world-news/69564/mep-antisemitic-hungarian-party-discovers-he-jewish>. Accessed on May 1, 2013.

an anti-Semitic rally was organized by neo-Nazi groups in Tiszaeszlár²²⁵ (a city known for anti-Jewish pogroms in 1882-1883).

113. In May 2013, the World Jewish Congress was held in Hungary as a sign of solidarity with the Hungarian Jews. Ronald Lauder, the World Jewish Congress President, stated: “Anti-Semitism in Hungary is on the rise and we have also witnessed a dramatic growth in the number of attacks on other minorities such as the Roma.”²²⁶ As a reaction to the event, Jobbik organized a rally of a few hundred people where Marton Gyongyosi declared that Hungary had “become subjugated to Zionism, it has become a target of colonization while we, the indigenous people, can play only the role of extras.”²²⁷

Summary

114. The amplification of the voices of the far right parties in Hungarian politics not only reinforces the existing anti-Roma and anti-Semitic sentiments but also directly contributes to actions against Roma and Jews.
115. The use of the “Gypsy crime” argument in the public arena feeds into intolerance and hate at the national level. According to ECRI, the “Constitutional Court does not balance the protection against incitement to hatred and the freedom of expression in the same way as the European Court of Human Rights.”²²⁸

5.7 Final conclusions

116. Using the UN Genocide Prevention Analysis Framework²²⁹ as a lens for analysis, the incidents, events, actions presented in this report constitute a strong basis to argue that Hungary must assess the growing risks that Roma and other minority populations face in terms of acts of violence, killings and physical and psychological insecurity.
117. Prejudice and discrimination against Roma have escalated into violent actions and physical assaults in recent years in Hungary. An accelerating pattern of violent actions was recorded between 2008 and 2012, when approximately 61 instances of violence and hate crimes were reported in Hungary. Extremists groups and civilians have used extreme violence, both physical and psychological, against the Roma, including the killing or injuring of Roma victims, the use of

²²⁵ Hungary – Antisemitic rally to memory of a blood libel, April 7, 2010.

<http://antisemitism.org.il/article/16434/hungary---antisemitic-rally-memory-blood-libel>. Accessed on May 4, 2013.

²²⁶ The World Jewish Congress comes to Budapest, May 2, 2013.

<http://www.economist.com/blogs/easternapproaches/2013/05/anti-semitism-hungary>. Accessed on May 4, 2013.

²²⁷ Jobbik rally against World Jewish Congress in Budapest, May 4, 2013.

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-europe-22413301>. Accessed on May 4, 2013.

²²⁸ ECRI, *ECRI conclusions on the implementation of the recommendations in respect of Hungary subject to interim follow up*, 2011. <http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/ecri/Country-by-country/Hungary/HUN-IFU-IV-2012-008-ENG.pdf>.

²²⁹ United Nations, *Office of the UN Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide: Analysis Framework*. http://www.un.org/en/preventgenocide/adviser/pdf/osapg_analysis_framework.pdf.

firearms and firebombs/grenades/Molotov cocktails, and the humiliation of children and adults. Roma faced blatant discrimination, violence, and insecurity on a daily basis.²³⁰

118. The recent Constitutional and Ombudsmen changes reflect a growing escalation in right-wing extremist policies in Hungary. In 2013, the violence and assaults have slowly been superseded by right-wing policies and legislation. Similar trends have been recorded in other countries such as Kosovo or Bosnia and Herzegovina where the violence and attack phase was replaced by anti-minority policies and legislation.
119. Hate speech and actions by extremists groups as well as by leaders, hate-motivated killings, stigmatization of Romani people, discriminatory practices (both individual and structural), and social and economic exclusion were on the rise in Hungary between 2008 and 2012. Neo-Nazis' groups organized secret military trainings and camps where members learned about theoretical military education and performed formation and shooting exercises.
120. Although the incidents provided very clear signals for taking action, the Government response was inadequate to stem the rise in racial crimes and extremist action.
121. The fact that these acts have not provoked a strong governmental response has emboldened the perpetrators and their followers, and has led to the perception that such action is the preferred solution to a problem defined in racist terms.
122. In the last five years, the increasing tolerance of far right speech and activity against the Roma in Hungary has led to institutionalization of racist political parties, acceptance of paramilitary organizations, anti-democratic legislation, and police indifference and impunity. These developments point to the heightened possibility that Hungary is moving into a more violent phase.
123. Efforts by relevant bodies in the EU, human rights and advocacy NGOs, and rare interventions by the Hungarian courts have exerted a small influence on the extremist trend in Hungary. It is unclear, however, whether these efforts will continue to have much effect, if the economic conditions in Hungary remain bleak and the right-leaning government moves further towards attacks on minorities as a means of maintaining majority support.

5.8 Recommendations

124. A risk assessment on early warning signs of genocide in Hungary conducted by the UN Office of the Special Advisor on the Prevention of Genocide and/or the OSCE could be a useful tool of assessment for the Hungarian institutions and the international community in order to benefit from the stronger protective mechanisms of these intergovernmental bodies against hate crimes and genocide prevention. Documenting the situation would help Hungary to take responsibility and

²³⁰ Margareta Matache, *The deficit of EU democracies: a new cycle of violence against Roma population*, Human Rights Quarterly, upcoming 2014.

implement measures to prevent the escalation of hate crimes, extremism, and violence and protect property and human lives of those under threat.

125. The European Union should design and implement a plan to curb the rise of extremism across Europe. These plans should include deployment of concrete mechanism of intervention and sanctions for failing to do so.
126. There is a necessity to revise EU policies to ensure that it can control and limit funding to those local and national authorities that actively promote discrimination and hatred or fail to promote and respect diversity and human rights, pursuant to the ECRI General Policy Recommendation no. 7.²³¹
127. The EU should consider the recent proposal from the EU Commissioner for Home Affairs, Cecilia Malmstrom, to establish a European Counter Violent Extremism Program,²³² which would provide recommendations for revising the EU Strategy for Combating Radicalization and Recruitment to Terrorism²³³ through measures designed “to help Member States and the EU institutions to better counter violent extremism.”
128. The Hungarian Government and intergovernmental bodies that are responsible for addressing hate crimes and preventing genocide may benefit from tracking, reporting, and publishing official data on hate crimes, and increasing the monitoring process and actions in combating extremism, discrimination, and violence against the Roma community.
129. The EU should consider encouraging Member States to collect, monitor and publicly report data on extremism, discrimination, and hate crimes in their own countries through its binding mechanisms, as it does as for other EU regulations. The reports published at the national level may include, among other issues, information about stages of court proceedings and decisions, and other materials provided in assessment of claims of discrimination and racially provoked hate speech and violence.
130. Hate speech and hate crimes should be punished in compliance with the ECHR standards and jurisprudence. As the ECHR stated in its decision in the *Vona v. Hungary* case,²³⁴ the use of “Gypsy crime” and other similar narrative is racist and meant to fuel intolerance and hate. Based on the ECHR’s decision and on existing Hungarian and EU laws, the Hungarian institutions should immediately investigate the legality of other extremist organizations in Hungary who are organizing military trainings for their members and rallies against Roma and Jewish.

²³¹ ECRI, *ECRI General Policy Recommendation no 7*, 2002

²³² Press conference by Cecilia Malmström, Member of the EC, on strengthening the EU's response to radicalisation and violent extremism <http://ec.europa.eu/avservices/photo/photoByReportage.cfm?ref=024783&sitelang=en>. Accessed on January 22, 2014.

²³³ Council of the European Union, *The European Union Strategy for Combating Radicalization and Recruitment to Terrorism*, 2005. <http://register.consilium.eu.int/pdf/en/05/st14/st14781-re01.en05.pdf>.

²³⁴ Case *Vona v. Hungary* <http://hudoc.echr.coe.int/sites/eng/pages/search.aspx?i=001-122183#%7B%22fulltext%22:%5B%22vona%20v.%20hungary%22%5D,%22itemid%22:%5B%22001-122183%22%5D%7D>. Accessed on October 22, 2013.

131. In Hungary's efforts to integrate Roma and ensure equality before the law, curbing extremism should become a national priority and visible results must be achieved.
132. The EU institutions and the international community could support Hungarian authorities to take all legal and judicial measures to ensure that perpetrators are charged and convicted for racist crimes.
133. Secret military trainings organized by neo-Nazi groups have been reported by NGOs since 2009. Organizing military trainings on weapon usage, combat, and urban fighting flouts the rule of law and democracy. The Hungarian Government should encourage its constituent institutions to investigate and prosecute organizations and individuals involved in secret combat preparation in order to ensure peace and security for all citizens.
134. It is welcome that the 2014 National Core Curriculum²³⁵ complemented the 2012 Curriculum's "Holocaust in Europe and Hungary"²³⁶ topic with "Discrimination, Exclusion and Genocide of People, Ethnic groups and Nationalities" and refined the "Persecution of Jews, the road leading to the Holocaust, Holocaust, Genocide" topic by specifying "Roma/Gypsy genocide". At the same time, the gravity and continued topicality of exclusion calls for a holistic approach to the education of the Holocaust, the genocide of the Roma as well as racial discrimination. The Hungarian State Secretariat for Public Education should consider mainstreaming the teaching of human rights, equality and protection of minorities as well as awareness-raising about the historic and contemporary forms of exclusion and violence against minorities throughout the Curriculum, including the weekly classes devoted to class discussions on topical issues as well as Hungarian values. Addressing these topics systematically outside history classes is a prerequisite for sensitizing future generation and preventing social fragmentation amounting to hate speech and violence.
135. The development of educational and mass media tools to tackle prejudice and discrimination against Roma could produce long-term benefits for both Roma and non-Roma populations, including social acceptance and decreased prejudice. The institutions involved in writing school curricula should consider developing educational tools aimed at reducing prejudice learned by children at home, in their neighborhood, and on television.

²³⁵ Government Decree of 7/2014. (I 17) on the Amendment of the 110/2012 Government Decree on the Issuance, Introduction and Application of the National Core Curriculum.
Hungarian Gazette 2014/4 p. 477. <http://www.kozlonyok.hu/nkonline/MKPDF/hiteles/MK14004.pdf>. Accessed January 28, 2014.

²³⁶ 110/2012 Government Decree on the Issuance, Introduction and Application of the National Core Curriculum.
Hungarian Gazette 2012/66 p 10718. http://www.kormany.hu/download/c/c3/90000/MK_12_066_NAT.pdf. Accessed January 28, 2014.



Members of the Jobbik Party and the Hungarian Guard march with a banner that reads: "Stop Gypsy Crime."

Credit: Photo taken from "Without a Chance," a documentary produced by the Hungarian Civil Liberties Union and released on January 7, 2014. The documentary can be viewed [here](#).